



**Final Report of the
Project for Promoting Bilingual
Workplaces**

March 2007

**Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –**



**Aberarad Business Park
Newcastle Emlyn
Carmarthenshire
SA38 9DB**

**Tel: 01239 711668
post@cwmni-iaith.com
www.iaith.eu**

Authors:

Steve Eaves
with Dr Kathryn Jones, Gareth Ioan and Rhys Dafis

The company and authors reserve their usual rights of acknowledgment when the text of this report is reproduced by other parties.

Commissioned by:
The Welsh Language Board
Market Chambers, 5-7 St Mary's Street, Cardiff, CF10 1AT
Tel: 02920 878000
www.bwrdd-yr-iaith.org.uk

CONTENTS

List of appendices

SECTION 1: SETTING UP AND OPERATING THE PROJECT

1. Introduction: The project's aim
2. Arrangements for setting up and managing the project
3. Definition of a bilingual workplace
4. An assessment of the current practices / situation within NWP and CCC at the start of the project, as regards the use of Welsh by staff and by the organisation
5. The approach employed to identify opportunities for the participants to increase their use of Welsh in the workplace
6. Trial initiatives by the two bodies, and the support arrangements
7. What was learned from the experiences of North Wales Police and Ceredigion County Council
8. Recommendations for North Wales Police and Ceredigion County Council on ensuring the continuing influence of the project

SECTION 2: ASPECTS OF THE WIDER CONTEXT

9. Lessons to be learnt from bodies whose administration is already through the medium of Welsh
10. International developments and comparisons as regards developing bilingual workplaces
11. Consideration of relevant elements – recruitment; training; IT - identifying the current situation and future trends
12. An outline of the legal situation

SECTION 3: RECOMMENDATIONS - WIDENING THE INFLUENCE OF THE PROJECT

13. A consideration of the resources that will be required to changes practices in different settings
14. Wider recommendations for the Board on how to develop the use of Welsh in the workplace

List of appendices

Appendix 1	Towards a definition of bilingual workplaces
Appendix 2(i)	A record of the initial language practices of the Ceredigion County Council project groups, April 2006
Appendix 2(ii)	A record of the initial language practices of the North Wales Police project groups, May 2006
Appendix 3	Invitation and Programme for the Project's Workshop / Launch Day
Appendix 4	Briefing notes for the Leader of Ceredigion County Council and the Chief Constable of North Wales Police on the occasion of the project launch
Appendix 5	Facilitation tools for the workshop sessions on the project launch day
Appendix 6	Risk Assessment Form for the Strategic Initiatives
Appendix 7(i)	Record of individual and group development initiatives, Ceredigion County Council
Appendix 7(ii)	Record of individual and group development initiatives, North Wales Police
Appendix 8	A series of positive e-mails and awareness-raising messages to staff
Appendix 9	Programme for the visit to Cyngor Gwynedd
Appendix 10	A report on the progress of the strategic initiatives
Appendix 11	A report on Part 2 of the project – Evaluating its operation

Section 1: Setting up and implementing the Project

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

1.0 Introduction: The project's aim

- 1.1. The Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces ('the project') is a project undertaken on behalf of the Welsh Language Board between November 2005 and April 2007.
- 1.2. In the brief for the project the Board described its aim as follows:

"Objective

The Board seeks to obtain a report on how to develop practical opportunities for bilingual administration, based on two detailed case studies. These two case studies will set the direction for and motivate two bodies who intend to implement a fuller bilingual internal administration, working to a higher standard. This would not occur at the same scale or speed were it not for the project. There will be an opportunity for other bodies to access this project and the experience and information collected in the form of the final report.

Close cooperation with the 2 public bodies will be necessary to develop their ability to work through the medium of Welsh, while paying attention to:-

- *The organisations' administrative culture*
- *The organisation's internal training language*
- *Written work*
- *Spoken work*
- *Resources and professional advice*

This will be a pilot project and the creative element of the work is considered important. It will also be necessary to be proactive and initiate the work. Recommendations and practical steps will need to be presented to both organisations, and more generally to the Board, and other organisations, regarding means of developing bilingual workplaces. This will be achieved as part of the project's final report."

- 1.3. The two bodies selected, and which consented to be the subjects of the two detailed case studies, were **North Wales Police (NWP)** and **Ceredigion County Council (CCC)**.
- 1.4. In choosing these two bodies the Board was conscious:
- that both bodies were on the point of adopting revised Welsh Language Schemes that would include references to the aim of increasing the internal use of the Welsh language in their administration;
 - that, in the case of both bodies, the workforce included a sufficiently large percentage of Welsh speakers and/or Welsh learners to enable the project to expand on, and add to, the current patterns of language use;
 - that both bodies served areas where a large proportion of the population speaks Welsh, and that the project outcomes could offer 'added value' by raising staff confidence and expanding their language use practices in their involvement with service provision;

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

- that both bodies represented a variety of geographical areas and of settings;
- that the work settings and levels of proficiency and confidence were sufficiently varied and representative within both bodies to ensure that the project outcomes would be relevant for, and of use to, a wide range of other bodies.

2.0. Arrangements for setting up and managing the project

- 2.1. The Welsh Language Board discussed the structure of the project, its strategic objectives and the intended outcomes with the Senior Management of the two organisations, including the Chief Executive of CCC and the Chief Constable of NWP. The Board gave special presentations for this purpose, and gained the consent and understanding of both organisations at the most senior management level.
- 2.2. The contract for the management, administration and facilitation of the project was awarded through a process of public tender. Both organisations were represented on the panel awarding the contract, which was won by Cwmni Iaith.
- 2.2. Shortly after the award of the contract, a **Steering Committee** was set up, with membership from the Welsh Language Board, North Wales Police, Ceredigion County Council, Cwmni Iaith and the National Assembly for Wales, to steer the project strategically and to receive feedback and reports from Cwmni Iaith and from the two bodies on the operation of the project as it progressed.
- 2.3. Each of the two bodies set up a **Working Party** to organise and co-ordinate the work of the project internally; to organise and co-ordinate methods of supporting and facilitating the project; to receive and respond to the minutes of the Project Steering Committee and to present the Steering Committee with feedback on the project's operation.
- 2.4. Under the project, participants were nominated from 3 – 4 service units in each of the two bodies, to undertake trial initiatives to increase their use of Welsh in their workplaces.
- 2.5. An attempt was made to select a variety of Service Units to take part in the project – that is, varied in the sense of representing
 - a range of communication skills required in different posts;
 - the number/percentage of those able to speak/write Welsh
 - the nature and degree of the current language practices
 - possible new domains.
- 2.7. The units were nominated by the two bodies themselves on the basis of guidelines provided by the Language Board. Those nominations were discussed by the Steering Committee, and accepted as being suitable for seeking to implement the project's objectives. The Service Units nominated to undertake the trial initiatives were:

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

Within North Wales Police:

- i. CONTROL ROOM, OPERATIONAL COMMUNICATIONS DIVISION (OCD), St. Asaph: this is NWP's call centre for the whole of North Wales. Over 100 staff desks receive a large number of calls every week. *Senior liaison Officer: Operations Business Manager.*
- ii. ADMINISTRATION OF JUSTICE DEPARTMENT:
Two service sections were nominated within this department, namely:
 - a. The custody suites, Western Division: accept, interviews detain and look after prisoners and receives their visitors. *Senior liaison Officer: Custody Suites Manager*
 - b. The Central Ticket Office, Prestatyn : processes penalty tickets and related correspondence; receives enquiries. *Senior liaison Officer: Policy and Research Manager*
- iii. THE WESTERN DIVISION: Regional Headquarters, Caernarfon; Offices at y Felinheli and Parc Menai, Bangor.
Senior liaison Officer: The Chief Superintendent, Western Division Commander.

Within Ceredigion County Council

- i. THE HIGHWAYS DEPARTMENT: administrative staff and the department's call centre at its main office in Aberaeron.
Senior liaison Officer: The senior Highways Officer
 - ii. THE PERSONNEL DEPARTMENT AND THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE'S DEPARTMENT Personnel Assistants and other Officers in the Chief Executive's Department
Senior liaison Officer: The Personnel Officer
 - iii. CONTACT CENTRE, SOCIAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT: the Department's telephone call centre, where initial phone calls are received from the public and referred to the appropriate services.
Senior liaison Officer: Operational Manager
- 2.6. The first 4 months of the project were allocated as a preparatory period. During this period Cwmni Iaithe consulted the senior managers of the two organisations to discuss the project's strategic aim and objectives and to establish a good joint understanding about methods of running and sustaining the project.
- 2.7. In addition, Cwmni Iaithe consulted the participants and their managers in their workplaces to obtain information and learn about the culture of those workplaces and the internal culture of both bodies in general. Discussion and consultation with representatives of the Units continued throughout the life of the project at meetings of the two bodies' dedicated Working Parties. As background and context to this consultation programme, research was undertaken into the two bodies' statutory Welsh Language Plans and any other aspects of policy that would be relevant to the project. These aspects are discussed further in section 4 of the report.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

- 2.8. The consultation programme also included specifically:
- Regular meetings with the project's main Liaison Officers in the two organisations.
 - A series of individual meetings with the Heads / Line Managers of each staff group.
 - Meetings with the relevant trade unions in both organisations.
 - Meetings with representatives of the two internal Translation Units.
 - Meetings with ITC officers in both organisations.
 - Meetings with Marketing / Public Relations Officers in both organisations.
 - Meetings with the participants and visits to their workplaces.
 - A meeting with the Head of NWP's Human Resources Department (CCC's Personnel Department was taking part in the project).
 - A meeting with CCC's Social Services Department Management Team.
 - A meeting with the CCC's Leader and Chief Executive.
 - Attending meetings of the two organisations' Working Parties.
- 2.9. The above-mentioned consultation was undertaken for several reasons. Firstly, it was important as regards establishing a good working relationship with the participants, their managers and those who would be in a situation to facilitate and support the operation of the project. Secondly, it was important to ensure a good understanding of the project's objectives and of what the two organisations and the Steering Committee expected of all the participants and contributors. It was felt that wide and regular consultation would also be a means to foster a sense of ownership of the project and a sense of joint endeavour and co-operation to increase of the use of Welsh among all who could contribute to its success. Of course, the consultation was also a means to ensure the transparency of the project and to engender interest in it among other staff.

3.0. Definition of a bilingual workplace

- 3.1. At the beginning of the project period the Steering Committee and the two Working Parties discussed and agreed on a definition of what was meant by 'a bilingual workplace' for the purposes of the project, a definition that would offer a framework for operating the project within the two organisations concerned, as well as being useful to the Board as a starting point for discussing a similar course with other organisations in the future.
- 3.2. Although the project aimed at extending opportunities for the use of Welsh beyond the domains where it is used in the service of the public in

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

accordance with the requirements of a statutory Language Scheme, it was soon realised that there was a good deal of overlap between the use of Welsh for the purposes of providing this service, and the use of Welsh in administration and the support settings which underpin that provision. For example, if an officer spends a considerable proportion of his/her working hours providing services to the public, then that officer's opportunities to make more use of Welsh are dependent to some extent on whether the use of Welsh can be strengthened in such service settings, as well as in internal administration, in internal dealings with the organisation and in informal internal communication with fellow members of staff.

3.3. Accordingly, the definition agreed on was based on two aspects of bilingual workplaces:

- the first based on an intention to normalise bilingualism within the organisation's internal culture and procedures; and
- the second based on the organisation's contact with the public and the effectiveness and efficiency of the way in which its services are provided bilingually.

3.4. The following definitions of these two aspects were agreed upon:

- a) **Circumstances that allow the organisation's employees a choice of language when:**
- (i) **carrying out their own duties,**
 - (ii) **receiving services and information from the organisation, and when**
 - (iii) **socialising informally with others within the organisation.**
- b) **Sufficient ability to respond to contact with the public in the original language (whether Welsh or English) without the help of an intermediary, e.g. a translator, both orally and in writing.**

3.5. It was also agreed that the term 'bilingual' can encompass a wide range of degrees of use of Welsh and English, and a wide range of ability in the skills of speaking, understanding, reading and writing Welsh.

3.6. **Appendix 1** reproduces in full the discussion paper 'Towards a definition of bilingual workplaces', which was produced to facilitate discussion and consideration of the contextual aspects of defining bilingual workplaces.

4.0. An assessment of the current practices / situation within NWP and CCC at the start of the project, as regards the use of Welsh by staff and by the organisation

General

4.1. At the beginning of the project period, we collected background information on language use practices within NWP and CCC in general; also familiarising

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

ourselves with the policy framework expressed by the organisations in their statutory Welsh Language Schemes. Briefing sessions were held with liaison officers from both organisations, participants in the project and other key officers to identify language use practices.

- 4.2. In addition, we received copies of job descriptions for all the staff concerned, so as to obtain a record of the current linguistic requirements of their posts according to their formal contracts of employment.
- 4.3. To add to this information, it was agreed with the CC Working Party and the NWP Working Party that the language practices of the staff taking part in the project would be identified and recorded by the staff themselves in workshop sessions. This record is summarised in **Appendices 2(i) and 2(ii)**.
- 4.4. The general context of the patterns of language use in both organisations had been determined by the policy commitments and expectations. Within the County Council, those commitments and expectations involved service provision in accordance with the requirements of the Welsh Language Scheme. That is, the emphasis in the minds of the staff was on the provision of bilingual services to the members of the public, i.e. external users/customers, according to their choice of language. While Part 1 of the project was in progress, the County Council was in the process of finalising its revised draft Language Scheme, and that Scheme contained a reference to developing the use of Welsh in the authority's internal administration. However, at the time the project was launched, the draft revised Scheme was so new that none of the participants interviewed was aware of the new expectations it contained as regards patterns of staff language use. Apart from its Welsh Language Scheme, the Council had no written protocol or other corporate policy on language use, apart from the unwritten internal 'practice' of ensuring, when some chief officers were appointed, that they were bilingual.
- 4.5. However, the Council serves an area that is traditionally considered one of the most Welsh. According to the last Census, 61.2% (n.= 44,635) of the County's population had some knowledge of Welsh (i.e. possessed at least one language use skill), and 44.1% (n. = 32,147) were able to speak, read and write the language.¹ In addition CCC has inherited its predecessor's tradition of using Welsh as the principal language at meetings of elected Members, and at the beginning of the project period a high percentage of the Council's staff were natural Welsh speakers who habitually used the Welsh Language in their informal and social interaction in the workplace as well as in their communities and with their families In addition several members of the Council's Management Team were Welsh speakers, including the Chief Executive, the Chief Administrative Officer and the County's Chief Legal Officer.
- 4.6. The majority of the project's participants were Welsh speakers, and the remainder were learners. According to the evidence collected by means of initial conversations, with some exceptions, the participants were on the whole unfamiliar with using Welsh in the more formal duties of their posts. Some of them were a little tentative about doing so, particularly for tasks that

¹ Aitchison, J and Carter, H. (2004). *Spreading the Word - the Welsh Language 2001*, Talybont: Y Lolfa, pp.38 -39

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

would require skills in drafting Welsh text. All of them were most comfortable using Welsh in the workplace when that was an extension of the types of traditional domains where they were used to speaking Welsh outside working hours - e.g. in discussion with Welsh-speaking users/customers and fellow members of staff in informal or semi-formal one-to-one conversational settings, either face to face or over the phone. However, they were all looking forward to taking part in the project and trying to extend their use of the Welsh Language.

- 4.7. NWP serves an area that includes quite a large part of North Wales. It includes some of the most Welsh areas such as the Llŷn, Arfon and Anglesey, Penllyn, Eifionnydd and the Conwy Valley, as well as areas with less Welsh along the Meirionnydd coast and the more built up and industrial areas such as Wrexham and Flint in the east of the catchment. It also includes the seaside areas of the traditional holiday resorts that extend from the northwest, eastwards from Llandudno, Colwyn Bay and Tywyn, as far as Rhyl and Prestatyn. At the beginning of the project period, on the range of levels from 1-5 used by NWP to define its employees' language skills, 6% possessed skills at level 4, and 19% at level 5, thereby giving a total of 25% fluent in spoken Welsh. Those employees were scattered across three quite extensive operational divisions, the Eastern, Central and Western Divisions.
- 4.8. Like CCC, NWP was also finalising its revised Welsh Language Scheme at the beginning of the project period. However, unlike the Council's Scheme, this one also incorporated a policy adopted in 2005 to influence the patterns of language use beyond merely contact with the public. This policy, The Welsh Language Strategy of the Association of Chief Police Officers (ACPO), is a *"strategy to increase and normalise the use of Welsh as the body's language of business"*. The strategy stated:

"Our strategic approach to the use of Welsh and English is based upon the following principles:

- *the Welsh and English Languages have equal status*
- *we aim to be a bilingual workplace"*

The strategy also stated that the tactics adopted to support these principles were:

- *"an innovative Welsh Language Scheme*
- *more business use of Welsh*
- *all entrants to possess basic (level 1) skills in Welsh*
- *recruitment and training through the medium of Welsh*
- *the opportunity for everyone to attend in-house Welsh-language training*
- *an increasing number of "Welsh Essential" posts*
- *guaranteed language choice in the Custody Suites and the Control Room"*

- 4.9. This policy had already been in operation for a year when the project began. NWP was thus already on track to develop the use of Welsh as a language of internal communication as well as in its policing services to the public before it began taking part in this project. In that sense, the liaison officers and the majority of the participants considered the project as a good opportunity to

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

underpin and strengthen trends and efforts that were already in place within NWP.

- 4.10. However, unlike CCC, the practice of attaching prestige to the use of Welsh was something fairly recent which had been established and fostered under the progressive and enthusiastic leadership of the Chief Constable, appointed in 2001, with the professional assistance of the full-time in-house Language Adviser who, again since 2001, has been promoting the use of Welsh, the Language Scheme and Welsh language training within the organisation.

The language use practices of the individual participants

- 4.11. In April - May 2006 a record was created of the current language use of the individuals who had agreed to take part in the project. Within NWP these individuals were based in four work units, and within CCC in three units.
- 4.12. In two workshop sessions, one in Aberaeron and the other in Colwyn Bay, participants were asked to record all the types of spoken and written communication, both formal and informal, which characterised their day-to-day work. Having done this, they were asked to note in what contexts they usually communicated in English, in Welsh or bilingually.
- 4.13. **Appendices 2(i) and 2(ii)** summarise, by participating unit, the participants' record of their language use practices as they carry out their various routine communication tasks in Welsh, in English or bilingually.
- 4.14. The information collected through this exercise is a record of the bottom line, or the 'starting point' for changing staff language practices.

5.0. The approach employed to identify opportunities for the participants to increase their use of Welsh in the workplace

5.1 The methodology for identifying opportunities

We set about identifying these opportunities by holding a briefing / workshop day for each of the two organisations, when trial activities to change staff language use were proposed, determined and recorded by the staff themselves, with consultants from Cwmni Iaith facilitating their discussions. **Appendix 3** reproduces a copy of a letter sent to participants in the project in Ceredigion County Council, inviting them to the workshop/launch day, together with a copy of the programme for the day.

- 5.2. The purpose, order and content of the two days were:
- i. To hold an event to 'launch' the project.
 - ii. To bring together staff from the different service units who are taking part in the project in each individual body in order to **establish their joint ownership of the scheme**, and to create a sense of unity in undertaking it.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

- iv. To establish CCC and NWP's corporate ownership of the project by arranging an **Address by the Leader of the organisation**. On Ceredigion's Workshop Day, there was an opening address by the Leader of the Council. In the same way, on the day of NWP's workshop, it was the Chief Constable who delivered the opening address. Both received briefing notes from Cwmni Iaith to facilitate the preparation of their addresses. **Appendix 4** reproduces the briefing notes for the Leader of CCC. Similar notes were provided for the Chief Constable of NWP. The purpose of their addresses was:
- to declare support for the project on behalf of the leadership and senior management of the organisation
 - to express appreciation of the staff's willingness to take part;
 - to explain that this was a project being carried out on behalf of the organisation in order to 'normalise' bilingualism in the workplace, to develop staff, to promote a Welsh ethos within the workplace etc
 - to encourage staff and to wish them well in their efforts to use more Welsh.
- iv. A session of **Language Awareness Training** by Cwmni Iaith to ensure that all staff started operating from the same knowledge base and with the same shared understanding of the project's objectives, its background and its context.
- v. To hold workshops with staff to identify settings for language change. The workshops were a means to invite staff to record:
- (i) their range of day-to-day tasks,
 - (ii) their habitual language use in carrying out those tasks,
 - (iii) and what practices they would seek to carry out in Welsh rather than English.
- vi. In addition, the workshops were a means for staff:
- to identify any possible obstacles/difficulties,
 - to detail the types of assistance / support they would need.

Method of grading the opportunities to change language use

- 5.3. Forms were specially designed to help participants record the relevant information at the workshops. **Appendix 5** reproduces the forms used to facilitate the process described in iv above.
- 5.4. The 'outcome' of the workshops and of the process outlined in point iv above is what was recorded by participants (a) as individuals on the form 'My Plan' and (b) as team members on the form 'Our Plan'. These two forms are reproduced at the end of Appendix 5. After noting on previous forms their current language use practices, and the opportunities to change language use in some types of communication, the participants noted on these two forms exactly what steps they intended to take to increase their use of Welsh.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

- 5.5. On these two forms participants were asked to note what immediate steps they could take to increase their use of Welsh, and what steps they could take over the following six months. Staff attention was also drawn to some obstacles that would hinder an increase in the use of Welsh in some fields.
- 5.6. This information was passed on to the managers of the staff concerned, to the Working Parties of the two bodies, and to the Steering Committee, and a number of discussions took place in the meetings that followed about grading what could be achieved in practice without staff having to hold back and wait for further assistance or input, and to identify steps that would require assistance or further input before they could set in place.
- 5.7. The Steering Committee, the two Working Parties and the managers of the relevant staff also contributed to the discussion about grading the implementation of the initiatives, expressing their views and their priorities as regards grading the initiatives, particularly from a managerial and strategic perspective. For example, within the NWP, it was decided that *Cysill* and *Cysgair* software should be installed on staff computers immediately, and this had been achieved by the end of summer/autumn 2006.
- 5.8. In addition to the staff record of their intentions as regards increasing the use of Welsh, as the project proceeded there were regular discussions with the chief liaison officers and the Working Parties within CCC and NWP in order to identify some aspects of progress that could not be achieved without forward-planning on the part of the organisations so that they could be realised over a longer period than the period of the project. One of the aspects identified was the need for bilingual input and output as staff made use of software programmes for very specific purposes at Ceredigion's Social Services Contact Centre, and software used by officers and staff of NWP Custody Suites when remanding a prisoner in custody.
- 5.9. These aspects required quite significant changes in computer programmes that had been commissioned long before the period of the project, and it would require efforts over a period longer than the project period for their resolution. It is significant that the project has been a means to motivate the two organisations to get to grips with these matters despite the certainty that they cannot be resolved during the period of the project.
- 5.10. In order to assist managers to organise, grade and timetable the operation of the trial initiatives, a Risk Assessment Form was prepared for their use, and one of the risks to which this form draws attention is 'the risk to the project's effectiveness or success'. Of course, such a risk could arise in the wake of the difficulty in timetabling the implementation of an initiative in a way that would facilitate its success. The Risk Assessment Form is reproduced in **Appendix 6**.
- 5.11. It has also been interesting to note that several of the steps the participants intended taking have been or will be a means to improve not only the internal bilingualism of the two bodies, but also the effective operation of their statutory Language Schemes. It was agreed that this had ensured that the project had been of 'added value' to CCC and NWP.

6.0. Trial initiatives by the two bodies, and the support arrangements

- 6.1. Throughout the process described in Section 9 above, the launch workshops gave rise to a range of action steps or 'initiatives' proposed by the participants themselves to increase their use of Welsh. The initiatives were identified in action plans, by individual and by group. (See the forms 'My Plan' and 'Our Plan' at the end of **Appendix 5**)
- 6.2. During the weeks following the launch, in consultation with the two Working Parties, each group selected one particular initiative from its group initiatives, in order to trace their progress in detail. These initiatives are referred to here as 'strategic initiatives'.
- 6.3. Thus, in steering the project and monitoring progress, the Steering Committee and the two Working Parties paid particular attention to these three particular aspects of participants' activities to increase their use of Welsh, namely:
- initiatives for individual development,
 - initiatives for group development,
 - the strategic initiatives.
- 6.4. Once the initiatives had been selected, one of the most important aspects of the project was to discuss with the participants, the two Working Parties and other key staff, and the Steering Committee the different types of support and assistance that would be required to facilitate the project's operation.
- 6.5. The three different types of initiatives implemented are discussed below, together with the support and assistance arrange to facilitate their operation, and useful comparisons between the two bodies are discussed at the end of this section.

Ceredigion County Council Initiatives

- 6.6. **Appendix 7(i)** reproduces the detailed record of the initiatives determined upon and trailed by individuals and groups within CCC.
- 6.7. Within the Council, although it varied somewhat from individual to individual and from group to group, there was a good deal of overlap in the development opportunities identified. The common elements could be listed as follows:
- Producing bilingual in-house forms, standard letters and electronic templates
 - increasing the use of Welsh in internal e-mails.
 - Increasing the use of Welsh in simple correspondence, internally and with the public, by drafting in Welsh first.
 - Facilitating more use of Welsh in internal meetings as regards spoken contributions, agendas and minutes.
 - Identifying and supporting learners and those less fluent in Welsh to develop in ability and confidence.
- 6.8. As regards the types of support that would be necessary, the following specific needs were noted:

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

- Opportunities for improving Welsh - particularly written Welsh.
 - Guidance as to how best to make use of the Translation Unit as a resource for checking and improving Welsh.
 - More information about, and access to, support aspects as regards IT.
 - Advice on how to support learners and the less fluent.
- 6.9. Of the above-mentioned range of initiatives, the strategic initiatives determined for each participating unit within CCC to enable detailed tracking of their progress were:

CCC strategic initiatives:

The Personnel Department and the Chief Executive's Department

The initiative: increased involvement with personnel matters in Welsh within the organisation by highlighting the bilingual nature of the Personnel Unit and facilitating bilingual procedures

The Administrative Unit, the Department of Highways, Property and Works (in collaboration with others)

The initiative: to support learners and those less fluent in Welsh to increase their use of the language

The Contact Centre, Social Services Department

The initiative: to consider issues relating to recording calls in Welsh and related IT issues

North Wales Police Initiatives:

- 6.10. **Appendix 7(ii)** reproduces the detailed record of the initiatives determined upon and trailed by individuals and groups within NWP.
- 6.11. Within the Police, while there was some overlap in the development opportunities and the initiatives identified from group to group, the impression gained was that there were substantial differences in confidence and aspirations. The common elements could be listed as follows:
- increasing the use of Welsh in informal conversations within the workplace;
 - increasing the use of Welsh in internal e-mails;
 - Increasing the use of Welsh in basic correspondence, internally and with the public, by drafting in Welsh first;
 - producing bilingual in-house forms, standard letters and electronic templates.
- 6.12. The most confident Welsh speakers, those in the Western Division, noted the following additional initiatives:
- identifying and supporting learners and those less fluent in Welsh to develop in ability and confidence;
 - facilitating more use of Welsh in internal meetings as regards spoken contributions, agendas and minutes.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

- 6.13. As regards the types of support that would be necessary, the following specific needs were noted:
- Opportunities for improving Welsh – both written and spoken.
 - More information about, and access to, support aspects as regards IT.
 - Advice on how to support learners and the less fluent.
 - Guidance on how best to prepare bilingual presentations.
 - Guidance on holding bilingual public meetings and internal meetings.
 - Guidance on facilitating the use of spoken Welsh in the Workplace.
- 6.14. Of the above-mentioned range of initiatives, the strategic initiatives determined for each participating unit within HGC to enable detailed tracking of their progress were:

HGC strategic initiatives

Operational Communications Centre (St. Asaph), Administration of Justice Department

The initiative: To increase opportunities for learners and Welsh-speaking staff to practice their Welsh with one another in informal settings in the workplace

The Ticket Office (Prestatyn), Administration of Justice Department

The initiative: To increase the practice of e-mailing in Welsh.

The Custody Suites

The initiative: To increase internal use of Welsh by formally offering language choice to every detainee and ensuring that all subsequent appropriate contacts are in the chosen language

Western Division

The initiative: To increase the use of Welsh in internal meetings

Necessary resources and support arrangements

- 6.15. Early on in the project it was agreed that securing appropriate resources and adequate support for the participants would be crucial to its success. Following consultation with the participants themselves, with the two Working Parties and with other key staff within the two organisations, on all the types of support that would be necessary, it was agreed that the four main aspects of the necessary support would be:
- the use of **information and communications technology**
 - arrangements for **staff training and development**
 - the co-operation and **assistance of the two in-house Translation Units**
 - and the need to **market the project internally** in a constructive and positive manner

6.16.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

The use of information and communications technology

Among the types of ITC assistance determined upon and implemented within the two bodies were:

- using the intranet and internal e-mail to disseminate information, news and messages of encouragement regarding the project;
- increasing the practice of writing e-mails in Welsh;
- installing the Cysgliad software package, which includes a Welsh spell-checker (Cysill) and a lexicographical resource (Cysgair), on the personal computer of all members of staff participating in the project;
- learning how to insert accents (e.g. the circumflex) in Welsh texts;
- providing space/spaces on the intranet to upload a bank of ready-prepared translations, whether of documents, standard letters / forms or useful phrases;
- links to lexicographical and grammatical resources;
- links to on-line learning resources;
- software for learning or practising Welsh (e.g. the Cymarfer package);
- installing Welsh interfaces on personal computers;
- including a design of a small badge with the wording '*Rwy'n siarad Cymraeg*' (I speak Welsh) or '*Rwy'n dysgu Cymraeg*' (I'm learning Welsh) in individuals' e-mail signatures, in order to inform others that they can communicate with the sender in Welsh;
- displaying the above-mentioned 'badge' design beside individuals' names in the electronic list of internal phone numbers, again in order to inform others that they can communicate with the individual in Welsh.

6.17. Arrangements for staff training and development

Methods of staff training and development determined upon and implemented within the two bodies included:

- training for Welsh learners – various levels,
- training to improve skills in written Welsh,
- training in the use of the Cysgliad software package,
- guidelines on the use of Cysgliad on the intranet,
- training on mentoring (i.e. training for the mentors and those whom they would be mentoring),
- a 'Buddy Scheme' with a local primary school – an arrangement for learners to attend Welsh classes at the school and practice their Welsh with the children and teachers,
- designating "language champions" in the workplace,
- feedback from the Translators on the work sent to them for editing / proofing,
- tying in the feedback from the Translators with formal training,
- computer links to on-line learning resources,
- improving skills in spoken Welsh,
- simple translation skills,
- "A word a day" and phrases displayed on the office notice board.

6.18.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

The co-operation and assistance of the two in-house Translation Units

The main ideas discussed and implemented by the Translation Units within the two organisations included:

- proofing and editing Welsh texts created by other staff;
- providing staff with feedback on the above;
- promoting the text editing service internally;
- translating materials currently available in English only;
- creating / expanding a bank of ready-prepared translations, whether of documents, standard letters / forms or useful phrases;
- contributing to the provision of terminology / glossaries for staff use;
- simultaneous translation in internal meetings;
- validating the standard of in-house "language champions";
- contributing a "phrase of the week" on the intranet.

6.19. Marketing the project internally and externally

NWP and CCC press officers discussed the need for an in-house marketing exercise within the two organisations in order to present the project to the staff of the two bodies in a transparent, interesting and constructive way. A number of useful marketing methods were identified and implemented

- Communicating with staff about the project using all available internal media including:
 - the intranet
 - the staff bulletin
 - e-mail
 - distributing the Language Board's "Iaith Gwaith" ("Working Welsh") material in workplaces
 - making Welsh more visually prominent on notice boards
- Issuing a series of positive internal marketing messages throughout the course of the project Within NWP, from September 2006 onwards, messages of this sort were sent via internal e-mail **Appendix 8** reproduces these messages.
- Using the briefing / workshop day as an occasion for marketing the project internally.
- Articles and photographs about the project and the participants in *Y Glas*, NWP's news bulletin, distributed to every home in North Wales
- Articles and photographs in *Sôn y Sir*, the CCC staff news bulletin.

6.20. Many of the above-mentioned aspects of the necessary support were ones that the service support units of the two bodies were able to set in place as part of their day-to-day work, without needing any additional resources for their implementation. Among these aspects were the work of internal marketing and some elements of the training and support work as well as several ITC aspects.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

- 6.21. However, discussion and consultation with the participants and the units continued throughout the life of the project in order to up-date our information about the types of assistance and resources that became necessary as the project progressed. The heads of support services kept a watch on the situation in order to:
- (i) identify what elements of the support noted above would require provision beyond the current provision and budget, and
 - (ii) to form an estimate, and inform the Working Party, of the amount of additional resources that would be needed to put that support in place.
- 6.22. As part of the project the two bodies were able to submit applications to the Welsh Language Board for further resources if necessary. When the strategic initiatives are discussed in the following paragraphs, reference is made to some types of assistance and support obtained under the auspices of the Board.
- 6.23. As well as the above methods of support, a **day's visit was arranged to the offices of Cyngor Gwynedd**, an authority that operates a policy of using Welsh as its main language of internal administration. The project's participants from NWP and CCC came together in Caernarfon that day to learn about the operation of that policy. Discussion sessions were also held, to give the participants and opportunity to question officers from Cyngor Gwynedd about their experiences and about specific aspects of good practice. **Appendix 8** reproduces the Programme for the visit.
- 6.24. Among the different aspects that Gwynedd officers shared from their experience and discussed with staff from the two bodies were:
- How Gwynedd set about establishing and implementing its policy of using Welsh as its main language of internal administration and what was the Council's experience of 'managing the change'.
 - How Gwynedd encourages the use of Welsh in internal administration work.
 - Gwynedd's procedures and experience in using Welsh as the principal language in internal meetings.
 - Developing the confidence and skills of Welsh-speaking staff and learners and their use of Welsh.
 - The main elements and considerations when providing training for improving Welsh.
 - Guidelines for mentoring learners - both the role of the mentor and the role of the learner.
 - Discussing Welsh-language skills as part of the annual staff appraisal process.
 - How the policy is presented to new staff.
 - Procedures and experiences when organising and providing vocational training / in-service training through the medium of Welsh.
- 6.25. In the course of the visit participants exchanged contact details with officers from Gwynedd, and arrangements were made for some of the participants - as well as those who were absent - to contact them again for further information and materials. For example, NWP's committee clerk was unable to be present that day, but arrangements were made for her to visit Gwynedd's committee clerks' department and Translation Unit another day,

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

and that visit was a very useful one, with an arrangement for the link to continue.

- 6.26. Several findings emerged from discussion with participants after their visit. Although CCC, like Gwynedd Council, has large proportion of Welsh-speaking staff, the CCC visitors felt that Gwynedd staff were much more confident in their use of Welsh. There was a feeling among the visitors that Cyngor Gwynedd's clear and definite policy on the internal use of Welsh had created a climate in which staff had become used to using it in a wide variety of settings. This in turn had fostered confidence and been a means to improve skills and fluency in Welsh by ensuring varied day-to-day use of the language.
- 6.27. It was also observed that there is an expectation among Gwynedd staff, because of the policy, that the language of internal administration and meetings will not be changed for the sake of non-Welsh-speaking staff who join the workforce. On the contrary, the latter are required to learn Welsh to the necessary standard to enable them to communicate effectively and professionally for administration purposes and in accordance with the policy. This means that there is no pressure on Welsh speakers to use English because Welsh is the default language in such a situation.
- 6.28. In such a climate, arrangements for staff training and development in Welsh-language skills is part of the enabling process - that is, a process to enable trainees to operate effectively as bilingual staff in workplaces which use Welsh as the principal means of internal communication.
- 6.29. It was also obvious from the comments of Gwynedd officers that there was an inclusive attitude towards the concept of 'competence in Welsh'. Officers recognised that staff possessed a wide range of competencies in skills of speaking, writing, reading and understanding Welsh, and that all these competencies at different levels, from the elementary to the completely fluent, can contribute to facilitating the use of Welsh in the workplace.

7.0 What was learnt from the experiences of NWP and CCC

North Wales Police

- 7.1. On the basis of evaluation exercises carried out by means of questionnaires and interviews with NWP participants after 9-10 months of operating their initiatives to increase their use of Welsh in their workplaces, records showed

As regards increasing the use of Welsh

- that 15 of the 18 participants interviewed reported they had increased their use of spoken Welsh.
- that 16 of the 18 participants interviewed reported they had increased their use of written Welsh.

As regards confidence in the use of Welsh

- that 6 were much more confident

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

- that 8 were a little more confident, and
- that 4 reported that there had been no change in their level of confidence (Of these 4, it is important to note that 3 had already stated that they were sufficiently confident before starting to operate the project)

According, then, to the feedback and to our own evaluation, the general view of the participants and our own view is that the project has on the whole succeeded in its objectives within NWP.

7.2. Turning to the **strategic initiatives** implemented; **Appendix 10** presents a report on progress made as staff worked towards achieving the strategic initiatives within NWP and CCC. On the basis of the information we received, our view of the success of the strategic initiatives within NWP is as follows:

1. Operational Communications Centre (St. Asaph), Administration of Justice Department

The initiative: To increase opportunities for learners and Welsh-speaking staff to practice their Welsh with one another in informal settings in the workplace.

- In our view this initiative has been partially successful. Owing to staffing difficulties and procedural issues during the project period it was not possible to realize the initiative to the desired degree. However, as the project period came to an end, steps were being taken to secure a Welsh resources room, appoint a Welsh tutor, set up a *Siop Siarad* and provide a number of the other aids desirable as part of this initiative. We believe that the project has been partially successful during the prescribed period, and that the steps now being taken augur well for establishing it more firmly in the future.

2. The Ticket Office (Prestatyn), Administration of Justice Department

The initiative: To increase the practice of e-mailing in Welsh.

- In our view this initiative has been very successful. The majority of the staff who took part in the project are learners who have been proactive and imaginative in communicating increasingly, with each other and with others in the workplace, in Welsh, employing several of the methods and aids listed in section 6 above.

3. The Custody Suites, Western Division:

The initiative: To increase internal use of Welsh by formally offering every prisoner a choice of language and ensuring that all subsequent appropriate contacts are in the chosen language.

- In our view this initiative has been partially successful. Some of the officers concerned have adopted the practice of establishing and recording prisoners' chosen language. It was impossible to realize the initiative in full without changing the (RMS) IT systems and long-established protocols for the treatment of prisoners. Despite this, the project has been partially successful by giving rise to

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

discussion with the relevant software providers and action at a strategic level with a view to achieving the aim of this initiative.

4. Western Division

The initiative: To increase the use of Welsh in internal meetings.

- In our view this initiative has been very successful. Particular regular meetings were identified that could be increasingly held through the medium of Welsh. With the assistance of mentoring opportunities and templates from Gwynedd Council, the clerk has adopted the practice of preparing a bilingual agenda and minutes. The intention is that occasional mentoring visits to Cyngor Gwynedd will continue and the practices established auger well for establishing and spreading the use of Welsh in internal meetings in the future.

7.3. The results of the evaluation exercises are recorded in our report to the Welsh Language Board on Part 2 of the project, and this report is submitted in full in **Appendix 11**. Our main findings are summarised below:

7.4. We believe that the factors listed below have contribute to the success of the Project within NWP:

- The progressive, enthusiastic and public leadership of the Chief Constable in promoting the Welsh language in NWP, and the example he and others among his chief officers have shown in learning Welsh and identifying themselves with Welsh culture.
- A progressive and ambitious Language Scheme.
- NWP has adopted as part of its revised Welsh Language Scheme, The Welsh Language Strategy of the Association of Chief Police Officers (ACPO), which is a "strategy to increase and normalise the use of Welsh as the body's language of business". The strategy states: *"Our strategic approach to the use of Welsh and English is based upon the following principles:*
 - *the Welsh and English Languages have equal status*
 - *we aim to be a bilingual workplace*
- NWP's leading role on the Welsh language and bilingualism among police forces in Wales.
- The presence and commitment of an internal Welsh Language Advisor to provide guidance on different aspects of the operation of the Welsh Language Scheme and language issues in general.
- The presence and commitment of a full-time Officer for Promoting Bilingual Affairs, a post at Chief Inspector level.
- An extensive programme of Welsh-language training for NWP staff and officers, with a wide range of courses, ranging from language improvement courses to courses for beginners.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

- An internal Welsh Language Committee including representatives from the different divisions and services. These representatives are responsible for implementing the Committee's decisions and promoting the use of Welsh in their local settings. The Committee meets regularly and its status is reflected by the fact that it is chaired by the Chief Constable.
- A Translation Unit with 5 full-time staff to facilitate the production of bilingual texts on behalf of all departments and divisions, and to provide a simultaneous translation service in meetings where Welsh is spoken.
- A recent and continuing campaign, conducted with a good deal of publicity, for recruiting Welsh speakers, and the success experienced in substantially increasing the number of bilingual recruits and prospective recruits.
- A condition of appointment that everyone joining NWP as a prospective officer or member of staff must possess at least Level 1 in Welsh, and achieve Level 2 by the end of the probationary period.
- An element of language awareness training as part of the induction process for new officers.
- Specific instructions and expectations for Senior Managers to foster and develop the bilingual elements adopted in NWP's Language Scheme and ACPO's Language Strategy.
- An ITC team that successfully mainstreamed aspects of developing the Welsh language within the compass of their work, work which in its turn comes into contact with every workplace and worker within the organisation.
- A public relations unit which succeeded in putting over positive and constructive messages to the workforce and the North Wales public about the Welsh language in general and this project in particular.

We shall expand on some of the above aspects in the following paragraphs

- 7.5. The progressive aspects mentioned above show that NWP was already on track to develop the use of the Welsh Language in its policing services to the public, as well as its use as a language of internal communication, before it began participating in this project. In that sense, the project has underpinned and strengthened trends and efforts that were already at work within NWP. The work which had already been done within the organisation had prepared the ground by establishing good levels of awareness and conveying positive messages about the Welsh language and bilingualism to the workforce. This had created a favourable climate in which Welsh speakers and learners were encouraged to take a pride in their language skills and consider them as an important asset to the standard and quality of NWP services.
- 7.6. Because, then, of the way the ground had been prepared, and because of the expectations amongst the labour force that the Police would ensure a practical way of moving towards fulfilling the commitments of its Language Scheme and the ACPO Strategy, the fundamental concept upon which the

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

project is based was not completely unfamiliar to the participants. On the basis of feedback, evidence and experiences gained in the course of the project, we can confidently state that this enabled NWP to take full ownership of the concept on which the project is based, strategically and in the culture of its participating workplaces, without, indeed, a great deal of difficulty.

- 7.7. As regards resources to establish more firmly the good practices that had been established and to spread them more widely in the future, again, we are confident that a number of the above-mentioned contextual characteristics will be a means to do this within NWP. The fact that NWP employs two full-time officers (a Language Advisor and a Officer Promoting Bilingual Affairs) at a high level to promote and facilitate the implementation of language measures is a very strong indication of how much prestige and status the Chief Constable attaches to the statutory Language Scheme and on the Language Strategy that is part of it. It also clearly indicates to the workforce and to Senior Managers in the organisation that the Chief Constable is determined to fulfil his very public commitment to the Welsh Language by a practical programme of work with a very definite message.
- 7.8. It is difficult to over-emphasise the far-reaching influence of the two full-time officers as a resource for promoting the Welsh language and bilingualising the services and the workforce. Within the last few years, it has been possible to a great degree to reverse some previous trends which hampered the expansion of the domains of the Welsh language and some unfavourable aspects of NWP's previous public image as an 'un-Welsh' body. This was achieved with a good deal of sensitivity and careful forward planning.
- 7.9. The two officers are supported by the team of officers from the Welsh Language Committee, and the contribution of all its member-representatives to promoting the Language Scheme and the Language Strategy within their divisions/services. Recently the Committee discussed some strengthening and formalising of these responsibilities, and this is certain to devolve ownership and responsibility for language issues and the spread of good practices - including those developed during the period of this project. Indeed, the Committee and the relevant individual officers have been forward planning for some months as to how to ensure effective continuation of the work carried out by this Project's Working Party.
- 7.10. NWP possesses a number of 'natural champions', that is, enthusiastic and influential individuals who seize every opportunity to promote the Welsh language and bilingualism in their day-to-day work. A number of these champions are already members of the Welsh Language Committee, and according to the feedback we obtained, the project has further legitimised their efforts and provided a means for them to strengthen their contribution even more. One of them referred to the project as a 'green light', giving the go-ahead for positive action to increase the use of Welsh in the workplace. A number of people said that the involvement of independent consultants (Cwmni Iaith) in the project was a sign of the Chief Constable's further commitment to the work.
- 7.11. Another crucial contribution to the work of the Welsh Language Committee - and the Project Working Party - is the contribution of the representative of the Information Technology Team and his colleagues. The team co-operated enthusiastically to realize the IT support for the project. They outlined this

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

support in a paper, early in the lifetime of the project - for example by installing Cysgliad software on the personal computers of project participants, by facilitating the display of a badge with the wording 'Rwy'n siarad Cymraeg' (I speak Welsh) or 'Rwy'n dysgu Cymraeg' (I'm learning Welsh) as part of officer and staff e-mail signatures, and by facilitating the dispatch of a series of positive and encouraging e-mail messages about the project to officers and staff. The team also co-operated with the Welsh Language Board to trial new software applications on the Board's behalf. The way the Information Technology Team have taken ownership of this work and responded constructively to the challenge of the project augurs very well for the future, since it shows that aspects of developing Welsh have now been mainstreamed within the compass of their work, work which in its turn comes into contact with every workplace and worker within the organisation.

- 7.12. NWP's extensive investment in the wide training programme available to officers and staff has created a favourable climate for Welsh learners and for those wishing to improve their Welsh language skills. The effect of the supportive ethos for learners can be clearly seen among the large number of learners who work in the Administration of Justice Department in Prestatyn. There was evidence of a good deal of enthusiasm and creativity among the learners there as regards ensuring for themselves a supportive and educational workplace outside their formal hours of learning Welsh. This in turn has influenced the attitudes of Welsh speakers, and made them more aware of, and proud of, their own language skills, and more ready to speak Welsh with learners and to assist them. A very significant factor in this connection is the readiness and good will of managers in supporting and facilitating methods of developing learners. There was evidence that this project had fed learners' enthusiasm, had given them encouragement and a certain amount of confidence to put their language skills to work and had raised the level of their expectations as regards assistance and support for learning.
- 7.13. As a communications resource, the Public Relations Unit was also very much alive to the opportunities to publicise the project, which was referred to in two substantial bilingual articles in *Y Glas* – a news-sheet delivered to every home in North Wales – during the period of the project.
- 7.14. Turning to the place of the Welsh language in the management culture of NWP, the fact has already been mentioned that several of NWP's chief officers are Welsh learners, and that a number of them are fluent. Frequently, in chief officers' meetings and when addressing groups of officers, the Chief Constable will take advantage of the opportunity to speak Welsh, and he chairs the Welsh Language Committee through the medium of Welsh.
- 7.15. Officers and staff at every level are very much aware of the high prestige attached to the Welsh language at the highest level in the Police. Without exception, at every one of the evaluation interviews we held with project participants, the participant referred with pride and appreciation to the 'example' of the Chief Constable in learning and using the Welsh Language and a number referred to the similar efforts of some of his fellow senior officers who have also learnt Welsh.
- 7.16. The fact that promotion, for posts at every level from top to bottom within NWP, is now conditional on possessing specific language competences,

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

connects the Welsh language in a definite and significant way with 'getting on in one's career' - somewhat reversing a long-standing historical tendency within police forces in Wales and in the administration of justice sector in general.

- 7.17. NWP's new Welsh Language Scheme includes commitments to integrating the Welsh language in management and policy determination processes, and the Welsh Language Advisor draws this to the attention of senior officers as appropriate in reports relevant to matters at strategic and policy level.
- 7.18. One field where a significant weakness was identified as regards strategic integration is the investment in the RMS computer system without giving adequate consideration in the specification for the applications to mainstreaming the requirements of the statutory Welsh Language Scheme. Specifically, it was not ensured that RMS could produce Welsh inputs and outputs as effectively, efficiently and easily as it could English inputs and outputs.
- 7.19. Another strategic weakness as regards the management of the divisions is the comparatively isolated nature of the Western Division as an operator of good, effective and consistent bilingual practice. There was evidence that the implementation of the statutory commitments of the Welsh Language Scheme was less complete and thorough in some fields of activity in the Central Division and the Eastern Division. For the public, this means that standards of service vary from division to division, and this can create a risk that statutory requirements will not be responded to effectively, that NWP's commitments in relation to the equalities and diversity will not be fulfilled, and that standards of service and customer care for Welsh-speaking users will not be achieved. It can also create confusion for the public as regards what types of Welsh Language provision they can expect from NWP.
- 7.20. Another field where operation could be improved is by a more robust integration of the way Welsh is learned and used into the annual evaluation process for officers, staff and managers (PDR).
- 7.21. While the good progress has been noted above, it must be added that the leading officers and many of the participants were very much aware that the retirement or resignation of the present Chief Constable, and the appointment of a new Chief Constable with different propensities, could also mean a change in the type of leadership from the top on language issues within NWP. The personality, priorities and values of any Chief Constable can have a far-reaching effect on the internal culture of the police force.
- 7.22. Our recommendations for North Wales Police are submitted in section 8 b

Ceredigion County Council

- 7.23. On the basis of evaluation exercises carried out by means of questionnaires and interviews with CCC participants after 9-10 months of operating their initiatives to increase their use of Welsh in their workplaces, records showed

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

As regards increasing the use of Welsh

- that 9 of the 18 participants interviewed reported they had increased their use of spoken Welsh.
- that 13 of the 18 participants interviewed reported they had increased their use of written Welsh.

As regards confidence in the use of Welsh

- that 5 were much more confident
- that 10 were a little more confident, and
- that 3 reported that there had been no change in their level of confidence

According, then, to the feedback and to our own evaluation, the general view of the participants and our own view is that the project has on the whole succeeded in some of its objectives within CCC.

7.24. Turning to the **strategic initiatives** implemented; **Appendix 10** presents a report on progress made as staff worked towards achieving the strategic initiatives within NWP and CCC. On the basis of the information we received, our view of the success of the strategic initiatives within CCC is as follows:

1. The Personnel Department and the Chief Executive's Department
The initiative: increased involvement with personnel matters in Welsh within the organisation by highlighting the bilingual nature of the Personnel Unit and facilitating bilingual procedures.

In our view this initiative has been successful only to a certain extent. As the project progressed it became clear that the necessary forward planning of resources in the form of the time of leading staff had not been sufficiently formal timely to ensure the desired progress. However, late in the life of the project, this was acknowledged and some personnel materials in bilingual form were actively prepared for the use of the Unit's 'customers', and attention drawn to them in the staff paper *Sôn y Sir*. One successful experiment was conducting 5 First Aid courses through the medium of Welsh. If work continues towards the aim of this initiative in a planned manner, the Personnel Unit can make a considerable contribution towards CCC's internal bilingualism in the future.

2. The Administrative Unit, the Department of Highways, Property and Works (in collaboration with others)
The initiative: to support learners and those less fluent in Welsh to increase their use of the language.

In our view this initiative has been partially successful. This is an initiative that was adopted late on in the project period, after it was decided that the original initiative chosen was unsuitable.

In October 2006, six mentors and four learners received training and guidelines on methods of supporting learners, as well as other aids. By this time the focus on the initiative is clearer in the Unit and both

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

learners and mentors feel comfortable with what is expected of them. It is therefore felt that this augers well for establishing this initiative more firmly after the formal project period has come to an end.

3. The Contact Centre, Social Services Department

The initiative: to consider issues relating to recording calls in Welsh and related IT issues.

In our view this initiative has been partially successful. It became clear in the course of the project that it was unlikely that the *Draig* software system could be adapted at short notice. Despite this, the project has been partially successful by giving rise to discussion at a strategic level on the competencies of *Draig* with a view to achieving the aim expressed in the wording of this initiative.

7.25. **Appendix 11** reproduces a full record of the findings of the evaluation exercises, taken from our report to the Welsh Language Board in Part 2 of the project. Our main findings are discussed below:

7.26. We believe that the factors listed below have contributed to the most successful aspects of the Project's operation within CCC.

- A programme of Welsh-language training is provided for CCC staff and officers, with a wide range of courses, ranging from language improvement courses to courses for beginners.
- CCC has an internal Welsh Language Committee that includes representatives from the different directorates and services. These representatives are responsible for implementing the Committee's decisions and promoting the use of Welsh in their local settings. The Committee meets occasionally as required under the chairmanship of the Chief Administrative Officer.
- CCC has a Translation Unit with 4 full-time translators to facilitate the production of bilingual texts on behalf of all departments and divisions, and to provide a simultaneous translation service in meetings.
- Welsh is the principal language of meetings of elected members.
- There is an elected member on the Council's Cabinet who is responsible for a portfolio of responsibilities including matters relating to the Welsh language.
- The workforce come from a catchment area which is traditionally Welsh and Welsh-speaking and the high proportion of Welsh speakers among them are used to using Welsh in a number of work domains, particularly in spoken communication with the public and with their colleagues.
- It is the ITC team that has successfully mainstreamed aspects of developing the Welsh language within the compass of their work, work which in its turn comes into contact with every workplace and worker within the organisation.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

- A public relations unit which succeeded in putting over positive and constructive messages to the workforce about the Welsh language in general and this project in particular.
- 7.27. When the situations in CCC and in NWP are compared, a number of differences come to the fore. A number of aspects of these differences are discussed in the following paragraphs.
- 7.28. CCC has no single officer with full-time charge for facilitating the implementation of the Language Scheme, mainstreaming the Welsh language in the authority's strategic planning processes and its service plans, developing initiatives to ensure equality for the Welsh language as part of the Council's equality agenda, developing the authority's response to the challenges of *laith Pawb*, nor developing guidelines and good practice for staff use. As a result, the prestige and status of Welsh as a language that belongs to formal and informal domains is not as high as in some local authorities whose catchment areas and workforces are much less Welsh and Welsh-speaking. Ceredigion County Council's situation is something of an exception to this pattern. There are posts like this in Powys, Carmarthen, Gwynedd, and Conwy local authorities and even in areas like Caerphilly, Blaenau Gwent and the County of Flint, where much less Welsh is spoken. Although it is still considered to be one of the most Welsh counties in Wales, it does not have a 'Language Officer' in the above sense, and the responsibility for the Welsh language is a comparatively small part of the very extensive portfolio of responsibilities and functions of the Chief Administrative Officer.
- 7.29. When visiting Cyngor Gwynedd for discussion day arranged as part of this project, we were given to understand that the procedure there is that a number of these important functions are shared between a number of key officers as well as being part of the terms of reference of the post of the Welsh Language Officer. Ceredigion Council has no system of this sort in place either. All these responsibilities are instead gathered together among the multi-function terms of reference of the Chief Administrative Officer.
- 7.30. This means that the Council had no senior officer to apply himself/herself proactively, for a good part of the working hours of a full-time post, to the task of promoting ownership of the project and the establishment and dissemination of any good practices arising from it.
- 7.31. Although a high proportion of CCC staff speak Welsh, because of the lack of the resource of dedicated and specialist staff, and the lack of a continuing and thorough-going focus on language issues, the level of language awareness of the project participants at CCC was not as high as that found among staff of NWP. None of the staff had ever received structured awareness training on the Language Scheme nor indeed had they received much encouragement or leadership from the top of the organisation with regard to using their Welsh in the duties of their post. As a result, when operating the Language Scheme without much guidance, Welsh-speaking staff tend to be comfortable using Welsh in domains not too different from the more traditional language domains, such as greetings and un-to-one conversation, face-to-face or over the phone.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

- 7.32. Since the project requires the extension of Welsh into new domains, this means changing practices and attitudes. When trying to introduce change of this type, the change needs to be carefully managed and guided, acknowledging that some staff may be doubtful or lack the confidence to extend their language use to unfamiliar domains. Within CCC there is no staffing resource to carry out the work of 'managing change', even within the limited scope of this project. Nor had the ground been prepared by any previous progressive attitude as regards the implementation of the Language Scheme.
- 7.33. This in turn has affected the level of confidence of Welsh speakers since the ethos of the internal culture has not been so proactive, so encouraging and so enabling as it could be. It was significant, for example, that the levels of confidence and enthusiasm of a number of learners in NWP were higher than among a number of the Welsh speakers in CCC.
- 7.34. Until its revised Language Scheme was published in 2006, CCC had no policy on developing the use of Welsh internally. As a result, there are no strategic instructions or specific expectations that Senior Managers will foster and develop the bilingual attitudes adopted in CCC's revised Language Scheme, even though some managers are supportive and enthusiastically in favour of them.
- 7.35. When one considers the way the Council's resources in communication skills are managed in general, it appears that although it has a 'language skills strategy', there is no very robust procedure in place for recruiting, developing and making use of language skills in the way recommended by the Welsh Language Board in its statutory guidelines. This is in clear contrast to NWP's proactive recruitment policy and the linguistic conditions it places on appointments.
- 7.36. Turning to the possible contribution of local champions in their workplaces, the Project Working Party had been set up to co-ordinate the work, with the liaison officers from the participating units as members. Despite the enthusiasm and good will of these liaison officers and effective corporation on the part of the majority, they too were at a disadvantage in seeking to contribute to the project because there was no co-ordinating leading officer to drive the project work forwards proactively and to ensure it had sufficient prominence and priority, nor were their terms of reference clear.
- 7.37. Having said this, the project Working Party has been a very useful structure to draw together the 'natural champions' and prospective champions to implement very specific steps. In addition, officers from different professional disciplines were drawn together to create a common platform for co-ordinating the efforts of different participants such as:
- The IT Unit
 - The Public Relations Officer
 - The Translation Service
 - Welsh Tutor
 - Training Officer
- 7.38. We consider that the activity of some of these participants has laid important foundations which can be built upon in the future if the Council wishes to

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

move forward to establish good practices more firmly. For example, as part of the project:

- first aid training sessions were held in Welsh for the first time.
- briefing sessions for prospective mentors and learners were held within the Department of Highways, Property and Works to set up a suitable and appropriate mentoring system.

These developments, and others referred to in this report, suggest, as the project draws to a close, that there is potential for fostering 'champions' and key participants on the basis of specific tasks and specific outcomes as above.

- 7.39. If CCC is going to go on to acquire the adequate specialist staffing resources to co-ordinate and give an appropriate focus and direction to the work of these participants, the joint understanding and the good corporation established among the members of the Working Party could augur well for future mainstreaming of the use of Welsh across departments and topics. This could in its turn facilitate the fostering of a constructive climate for the operation of the authority's new Welsh Language Scheme and for seeking to ensure the continuation of some of the good practices which have resulted from this project.
- 7.40. At the level of strategic guidance, the Welsh Language Board gave an oral presentation on the project to the Management Team before the preparatory work for the project commenced in winter 2005, and received a favourable response. In addition, on the project's launch day, the Leader of the Council delivered a supportive and encouraging address to participants, setting a very positive keynote.
- 7.41. However, when the Chief Executive was interviewed in spring 2006, he considered that this project would be something mainly for the benefit of the Welsh Language Board, rather than seeing it as a trial project of which the Council could take advantage as a cautious way of introducing changes in the authority's internal culture. During the course of the project period, apart from the Chief Administrative Officer's liaison work and his role as principal link within CCC, there was little contact between the project and the Management Team. We can hardly report, therefore, that there has been a lead from the top of the officer hierarchy within CCC or that CCC's management culture provides clear and definite indications that it attaches prestige to operating through the medium of Welsh. Unfortunately then, owing to the various factors above, for the most part of the period of the project, resources were not in place and an appropriate climate had not been created, to lead CCC to 'take ownership' of the concept upon which the project is based - either strategically or in the culture of its workplaces.
- 7.42. However, in the final period of the project there were a number of definite indications that the project was beginning to become better established. The member of the Cabinet responsible for the portfolio of responsibilities including the Welsh Language attended meetings of the Working Party, showing the support of the Council's elected Members for the project. It is also proposed to submit a progress report on the project to the Management Team and the Cabinet.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

- 7.43. The Working Party has already discussed the need for an internal policy statement which would give a clear and unequivocal indication to staff that the authority intends to foster more use of the Welsh Language in its internal administration. In this connection reference has been made to NWP's ACPO Language Strategy, referred to in section 4 above. Following this discussion, a draft statement has been drawn up for further discussion by the Management Team and the Council.
- 7.44. In the light of the above discussion and our evaluation of the effect and influence of the project so far, our recommendations to Ceredigion County Council are presented in Section 8 below.

8. Recommendations for North Wales Police and Ceredigion County Council on ensuring the continuing influence of the project

8.1. Recommendations for North Wales Police

1. NWP should continue to establish more firmly and to integrate the use of Welsh in its procedures, systems and working practices, so that it is inextricably woven into the fabric of North Wales Police's policing service and the work culture which underpins it.
2. The Language Committee should consider how to ensure that the progress and enthusiasm stimulated during the project continue.
3. Protocols should be agreed on the use of Welsh at work in various settings which support and mainstream the continuation of the aims of this project and the Language Strategy of the Association of Chief Police Officers (ACPO).
4. There should be some formalisation of the role and contribution of the departmental representatives on the Language Committee and the local 'champions' by defining them clearly.
5. The quality and standards of NWP's bilingual services should be more consistent from Division to Division as should the opportunities and encouragement to officers and staff to use the Welsh Language in maintaining internal administration.
6. Language awareness training should be integrated as a core element of professional training for officers and staff.
7. NWP should ensure that all its computer systems can operate in a linguistically appropriate and effective way as regards carrying on the business of the force bilingually, and should ensure that every system planned and ordered in future is forward planned to this end.
8. The Language Committee should consider arranging a series of monitoring exercises to test the standards and effectiveness of NWP's bilingual services and staff awareness of good bilingual practices.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

9. Consideration should be given to integrating aspects of learning, using and promoting Welsh in a more thorough-going way in the staff evaluation process (PDR) as follows:
 - Including in the PDR for staff and officers an evaluation of staff achievement in learning Welsh according to the agreed learning targets.
 - Including in the PDR for staff and officers an evaluation of the extent to which they use their Welsh language skills to promote the ends of the Language Scheme and the ACPO Strategy.
 - Including in the PDR for managers an evaluation of their effectiveness in managing the language skill resources of their services, promoting a Welsh Language ethos within the workplace and creating a favourable climate which contributes to achieving the aims of the Language Scheme and the ACPO Strategy.
10. At the level of the project participants, consideration should be given to the more detailed recommendations put forward in our evaluation report presented to the Welsh Language Board.

8.2. Recommendations for Ceredigion County Council

1. Robust policy guidance should be set in place.
2. A dedicated leading officer should be appointed to promote this guidance, to facilitate the implementation of the Language Scheme and to develop proactive responses to the challenges contained in the scheme and in the wider linguistic agenda, at the policy level and at the service operation level.
3. Protocols should be developed and agreed on the use of Welsh at work in various settings which support and facilitate policy aims.
4. Adequate time and resources should be ensure to plan guidance and support.
5. The role of the relevant portfolio holder should be developed and appropriate priority should be ensured.
6. A standard procedure should be established to identify the language requirements of posts within the framework of the Language Skills Strategy.
7. A wide-ranging system of training for language learning and improvement should be secured, together with a mentoring scheme for the whole authority.
8. An extensive programme of language awareness training should be developed for the authority's officers and Members, beginning with training for the Management Team.
9. CCC should ensure that all its computer systems can operate in a linguistically appropriate and effective way as regards carrying on the business of the Council bilingually, and should ensure that every system planned and ordered in future is forward planned to this end.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

10. Consideration should be given to arranging a series of monitoring exercises to test the standards and effectiveness of CCC's bilingual services and staff awareness of good bilingual practices.
11. At the level of the project participants, the more detailed recommendations put forward in our evaluation report presented to the Welsh Language Board should be implemented.

Section 2: Aspects of the wider context

9.0 Lessons to be learnt from bodies whose administration is already through the medium of Welsh

- 9.1 In order that lessons about promoting bilingual workplaces could be learned from bodies which already carry out their administration in Welsh, we set about collecting evidence by interviewing the key individuals at the National Library of Wales, Aberystwyth, the Welsh Books Council, Aberystwyth, and Tai Cantref, Newcastle Emlyn. In each case, face-to-face interviews were held with the Heads of Human Resources.
- 9.2 In addition, a visit was paid to Cyngor Gwynedd in the course of the project, taking advantage of the opportunity to question a variety of members of staff about the Council's policy and practices as regards the internal use of Welsh. There was also an extended interview with the Assistant Director of the Department of Education and Community Services, Ceredigion County Council, as well as with the Departmental Translator. This Department is an example of a department which is perceived by members of other departments of the County Council and by the public in general, as being one whose administration is carried out in Welsh or certainly a department which attaches prestige to the Welsh Language in its activities.

Current practice

- 9.3 At Cyngor Gwynedd, the National Library, the Books Council and Tai Cantref, Welsh is the main overall working language of the staff. Of the workforce of about 300, it is estimated that 98 per cent of the staff of the National Library are competent in Welsh. All but three of the 47 permanent staff members at the Books Council are competent in Welsh (excepting casual packers at the Book Distribution Centre). Only two of the 70 staff members at Tai Cantref are unable to speak Welsh. There are no firm statistics about the language skills of Cyngor Gwynedd's workforce, but it is estimated that the percentage is at least as high as, if not higher than, the general percentage of Welsh speakers in the County's population, i.e. about 70 per cent.
- 9.4 Welsh, almost without exception, is the language of both spoken and written internal communication in those three organisations. Memos and other general communications are as a rule sent in Welsh, or bilingually if some of the recipients are non-Welsh-speaking. It is estimated that 90 per cent of the e-mail messages within the National Library are sent in Welsh. This figure could no doubt be higher within the Books Council and Tai Cantref. Both the external and internal websites of these bodies are bilingual.
- 9.5 Welsh is also the language of internal meetings, almost without exception. It is estimated that about 80 per cent of all the National Library's meetings are held through the medium of Welsh, with a number of others being bilingually. Meetings in English only are the exception. In the case of the Books Council, meetings dealing with English-language publications or meetings about sales campaigns arranged by non-Welsh-speaking staff are the exception to the practice of holding meetings through the medium of Welsh. Welsh is the language of Tai Cantref's internal meetings except for the occasional team meeting which includes a non-Welsh-speaking member or members of staff. Those meetings and held bilingually. At Tai Cantref it was noted that the

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

occasional meeting between individual members of staff could take place through the medium of English from time to time but such meetings were exceptions.

- 9.6 In those cases where non-Welsh-speaking individuals are present at meetings, the Library provides a simultaneous translation service. This is also the case at Tai Cantref. It also takes place at meetings of the Council and Steering Committee of the Books Council. In the Books Council's staff meetings, translation takes place more informally, with a Welsh-speaking member of staff sitting beside a non-Welsh-speaking member to 'whisper' a translation of the discussion. The three institutions prefer to hold meetings with their partners and providers through the medium of Welsh, with the Library providing simultaneous translation equipment to facilitate bilingual discussions.
- 9.7 Welsh is also the principal language of informal contact in these two institutions, and in the case of the National Library, the Pen Dinas Restaurant is an ideal focus for informal staff contacts. Tai Cantref organises occasional weekend social events where staff and their partners can use their Welsh in a social setting.
- 9.8 Turning to Cyngor Gwynedd, possibly the most conspicuous example of bilingual internal administration, we understand that the situation is very similar to that described above, with Welsh being recognised as the Council's principal language of administration. On the whole, Welsh is the language of internal meetings and internal communications, with exceptions occasionally allowed in some circumstances. The simultaneous translation service is available to staff, with responsibility for its provision being devolved to individual departments. The Translation Service is also available to staff to translate material into English.
- 9.9 In the case of Ceredigion, there is a strong perception both in and outside the Council that the Education and Community Services Department of Ceredigion County Council has a strong Welsh Language ethos. There is no doubt that this is true, with Welsh as the principal working language of a great part of the Department, at least for spoken communication. However, there are a number of service units within the Department and, taking the work practices of these units individually, we see that a range of patterns of language use emerges from one unit to the next, with units like Theatr Felinfach and the Libraries operating almost entirely through the medium of Welsh; the Advisors' Team and the Schools Unit making extensive use of Welsh in both their spoken and written work; a unit like the Leisure Service and the Youth Work Unit carrying out their internal administration entirely in English to all intents and purposes; and other units, such as the Archives and the administrative staff operating bilingually to various degrees. A Departmental Translator is provided to facilitate written bilingualism in the Department and it is estimated, as regards text / written material, that 25 per cent of the Department's professional work and five per cent of the administrative work is drafted first of all in Welsh. (The other four bodies also, of course, use translation services to facilitate the production of bilingual material). As regards internal meetings, Welsh would be the common language among Welsh speakers. However, there is no ancillary protocol or system in force to facilitate bilingual meetings within the Department, and English is used as a common language at those times.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

Policy guidance

- 9.10 Putting in place robust policy guidance appears absolutely central in order to promote the use of Welsh in the workplace in every one of the institutions interviewed. In Cyngor Gwynedd that guidance has been given quite clearly, and the Welsh language has been stated to be the Council's principal language of administration. The Language Scheme states that one of the Council's principal aims as regards the Welsh language is:
- *"To establish Welsh as the official internal administrative language of the Council by providing facilities for in-post training to enable staff to develop their linguistic skills in Welsh and English."*
- 9.11 This aim ties in with other aims relating to the promotion of Welsh within and outside the Council, in the community and among corporate partners. Tai Cantref too has a well-defined policy on this matter, which is part of a wide vision of the organisation's role in the context of the Welsh language. The policy has now been incorporated in its draft Language Scheme, from which the following is taken:
- "The aim of Cantref's language policy is to promote the use of the Welsh language in a bilingual catchment area.. Through its policy, Cantref ensures that tenants receive a service through the medium of Welsh or English as they choose . Welsh is also Cantref's internal language of administration."*
- 9.12 No definite statements to this effect had been made in the cases of the National Library and the Books Council. The situation there has developed through a combination of a strong ethos in favour of the Welsh Language and the historical practices of the staff. These are practices which have evolved 'naturally' in circumstances where the vast majority were Welsh speakers and in an atmosphere which attaches prestige to the Welsh language. However, these practices are fully and loudly supported by the senior management of these institutions at every level.
- 9.13 Traditionally, the same ethos, history and tradition in favour of the Welsh language is true of Ceredigion County Council's Department of Education and Community Services. However, as the number of non-Welsh-speaking staff within the department has increased, without a clear statement of the place of the Welsh language within the administration, this inheritance and these values could be eroded. The Library has recently recognised this danger as new progressive projects are set up, and schemes are afoot to create a document called a 'Language Duty' which will sit together with a family of other 'Duties' in relation to the Equalities.
- 9.14 As regards promoting the language practices policy, and indeed the language schemes, none of these organisations had a dedicated 'Language Officer' . It appears that the responsibility for promoting, supporting and superintending operation - both internal and external - through the medium of Welsh has been mainstreamed to various corporate functions within the organisations: Heads of Human Resources, Training Officers and Chief Executives or Administrative Directors. That is certainly the situation in Cyngor Gwynedd.

Welsh as a job competence

- 9.15 Welsh is considered as a general competence by Cyngor Gwynedd, the National Library of Wales, Tai Cantref and the Books Council. The internal cultures are part of the context for that, but the nature of the work or the 'audience' to be served, are also quite crucial to designating levels of language skills. The Books Council emphasised, with the occasional exception, that every member of its staff required a knowledge of Welsh to different levels for different purposes, from the Management Team to the staff at the Books Centre who read orders and pack titles. It is thus the nature of the work that is the main motivation in this connection, with this arising from the Council's fundamental *raison d'être* - promoting Welsh language books and books of Welsh interest. As noted above, Cantref places an emphasis on the linguistic nature of the area it serves as well as on its duties under its Language Scheme. The requirements of individual posts and the organisation's internal culture are factors that justify the language requirements.
- 9.16 As the National Library has developed its services to the public over recent years, acquiring and developing Welsh language skills has become increasingly important within the organisation, more so than if it were just an enclosed and academic ivory tower. The Library is in the process of developing a competences framework, with knowledge of Welsh as a basic competence alongside other aspects such as communication, leadership, the ability to make decisions and so on. The revised version of the Managers' Handbook will include a framework for measuring competence in Welsh. Cantref is currently using a framework of language competences, and Cyngor Gwynedd is also considering similar steps at the moment, considering adopting the European ALTE framework for doing this, with the intention of identifying essential language levels for individual posts in due course.
- 9.17 Proficiency in Welsh is identified as a job competence in Ceredigion County Council's Department of Education and Community Services as well, but without a formal framework to assist in this process. The tendency there is to look at individual cases according to their merit and circumstances. It appears that the adoption of a Language Skills Strategy or a competences framework could be an important asset for them when determining and rationalising the need for skills in Welsh.
- 9.18 Although Welsh has been established as a job competence in these institutions, support and encouragement were the tools used to achieve this. Although sanctions against lack of achievement are a possibility, we found only one example among these organisations of dismissal on the grounds of the inability to achieve the expected level of proficiency in Welsh. The creation of a supportive and encouraging atmosphere seemed to be a much more constructive tool, especially when based on a robust Welsh-medium work culture.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

Support for staff

Improving Welsh-language skills

- 9.19 The five organisations report that identifying language improvement needs is part of the annual performance appraisal or staff development process, and every one of the institutions was very supportive towards staff as they improved their Welsh language skills. Training was readily available to learners in the five organisations, with examples been reported of individuals who had successfully learnt Welsh to different levels of proficiency.
- 9.20 The Books Council had allowed a new Head of Department three months secondment on full pay to learn Welsh with personal tutors locally. The officer succeeded to a level where (s)he now makes full use of the language in his/her post in the world of publishing. The same arrangement would also be available within the National Library, and Ceredigion County Council's Department of Education and Community Services acted on the same lines when appointing personal tutors for a recently-appointed non-Welsh-speaking Service Head. Cantref also provides the full range of usual courses. Indeed, it is estimated that about half of Cantref's staff are second-language Welsh speakers.
- 9.21 The usual range of courses for Welsh learners is also available in the county councils as required, and the five organisations offer language improvement courses for Welsh speakers - in both spoken and written Welsh. In Gwynedd, occasional short courses are provided on topics such as Mutation, Verb Tenses, Common Errors and Clear Welsh. The Books Council offers an e-mail tutor service to a member of staff whose skills in written Welsh require improvement. Cantref offers two courses in improving written Welsh - one general course provided by the local Further Education College, and provision by a private sector service, specially tailored to the needs of Cantref's managers. The Library also offers language improvement courses to staff at two levels. Cyngor Gwynedd also offers improvement courses specially tailored for the needs of service units, where staff can concentrate on creating 'real life' text as well as learning relevant terminology.
- 9.22 Both Cyngor Gwynedd and Ceredigion County Council are in the practice of acknowledging the achievements of successful learners. Gwynedd arranges an annual awards ceremony, with a variety of awards for learners, mentors and staff who have attained a working level of fluency.
- 9.23 Interestingly, the Library has a work-buddy Scheme where new staff who have not previously worked through the medium of Welsh are paired with an experienced member of staff to facilitate the induction process. A mentoring scheme was available in Gwynedd for Welsh learners as well as a language correction service for them. A speed-dating event had been mooted as a possible means of pairing mentors and learners, but the pairing usually occurred informally within the workplace.

Information technology

- 9.24 Ensuring Welsh spell-checking software is crucial in facilitating staff use of written Welsh. Cysgliad is available to everyone in the National Library and in Tai Cantref, and the Books Council is also on the point of making it more

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

widely available when it updates its computer system. Representatives of Cyngor Gwynedd also considered this software essential. A corporate licence for its use can be arranged through Canolfan Bedwyr.

- 9.25 In addition, the Library noted that it offered all its staff Welsh-medium ECDL courses, which accustom them to the use of Welsh when using IT.
- 9.26 In Cyngor Gwynedd, staff used translation memory software, and corporate work terms were kept in a database; staff were also referred to the TermCymru website. The Council was also in the process of introducing the Welsh interface for Microsoft software.

Vocational training

- 9.27 Welsh was the first language for vocational training in Gwynedd, the National Library and Tai Cantref, with provision in English only if a Welsh-speaking trainer was not available or, in the case of Gwynedd and the Library, as an option following the provision of Welsh-medium training in the first place. Welsh was also the language of choice in the Books Council's training arrangements. In Ceredigion the medium for vocational training varied according to a number of factors - the availability of trainers, the topic involved and the chosen language of the participants.

Conclusions

- 9.28 The above-mentioned organisations represent a range of public and semi-public bodies in west Wales whose administration is carried out through the medium of Welsh or bilingually. They vary in their size, constitutional status, geography and fields of activity. On the basis of the interviews held, we can come to the following general conclusions as regards these five bodies:
- 1) They see maintaining a Welsh-medium or bilingual internal administrative culture as part of their corporate mission and their role as service providers.
 - 2) Those values are accorded prestige and status at the highest levels of the organisation; those values and aspirations are incorporated to different extents in policy documentation and the majority of the staff body shares the values and the vision.
 - 3) They share a pride in the fact that they are able to offer opportunities to their staff to use the Welsh Language in their day-to-day work. For example, in an internal survey, 98 per cent of Cantref's staff noted that they were glad of the opportunity to use Welsh in the workplace.
 - 4) On the whole, there are robust staff recruitment policies that note the need for staff to be competent in Welsh to different levels of ability (justifying that against a number of measurable factors), policies that receive realistic support to enable staff of every linguistic ability to achieve appropriate levels of proficiency.
 - 5) They support and assist staff in improving their Welsh language skills and in extending their use of Welsh in their work through varied training

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

activities and by providing dedicated resources, e.g. IT, language reference books and action guidelines.

- 6) It could be argued that these bodies are exceptional as regards the proportions of Welsh speakers on their staff. There is no doubt that ensuring a 'critical mass' of Welsh speakers is an asset in maintaining a Welsh or bilingual administrative policy. However, the background and levels of language proficiency of the staff bodies are not all the same. There are high numbers of second-language Welsh speakers among some of these bodies and the range of proficiency is a wide one. It has already been noted that about half Cantref's staff are second-language Welsh speakers, including the Chief Executive and the Head of Human Resources.
- 7) Nor is the situation here a static one. Each of these bodies is on a developmental journey that has seen a change in its internal language practices over a period of time. In the case of the National Library, it is a journey from English-medium administration, historically, to completely bilingual administration, or even administration entirely through the medium of Welsh in several cases. It is a journey that has taken some 30 years, with the greatest strides possibly having been taken during the last decade.

Although Cyngor Dosbarth Dwyfor (one of Cyngor Gwynedd's predecessors) was an historical exception from the point of view of the use of the Welsh language in local government, in general Cyngor Gwynedd and Ceredigion County Council have also experienced a similar journey; a journey from the presumption that English is the language of public administration in Wales. The effect of this historical perception, which the Welsh Language Act 1993 did so much to undermine, cannot be under estimated.

In the case of Tai Cantref and the Books Council, the journey has, if anything, been in the other direction. Both these bodies were set up with a Welsh-medium or bilingual administration as a core part of their values and operation. The challenge to these bodies in recent years is incorporating a small number of non-Welsh-speaking staff into their ranks without undermining their core principles in this connection.

- 9.29 It is clear, from the evidence of the above-mentioned bodies, that it is perfectly possible to maintain a bilingual administration if the appropriate atmosphere, leadership and resources are ensured. There is no doubt that a number of other bodies could learn from their good practice. Certainly they make a robust contribution to promoting the aims of *Iaith Pawb* as regards:

"... bringing about an increase in the use and visibility of the Welsh language in all aspects of everyday life, including work ..."

10.0 International developments and comparisons as regards developing bilingual workplaces

- 10.1 To learn about experiences in developing bilingual workplaces in other parts of the world, information was collected by sending a specially-designed

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

questionnaire to a number of foreign contacts and experts in international language planning. Follow-up telephone interviews were held with representatives of *Secretaria de Política Lingüística de la Generalitat de Catalunya* (the Language Policy Secretariat of the Government of Catalonia); *Kultur Saila, Euskadi* (The Ministry for Culture, Autonomous Government of the Basque Country); and *An Roinn Gnóthaí Pobail, Tuaithe agus Gaeltachta* (The Department of Community, Rural and Gaeltacht Affairs) in Ireland.

- 10.2 In addition we reviewed recent international publications and conference papers in the fields of bilingualism in the workplace and language technologies, and investigated the websites of international bilingual organisations. We also carried out telephone interviews with language technology developers.
- 10.3 When an international survey is carried out, it becomes clear that coping with the use of more than one language in the workplace is an issue relevant to countries on every continent. On the whole, however, there is a tendency to deal with languages separately rather than developing workplaces which operate in a truly bilingual / multilingual manner.
- 10.4. In this section, we concentrate on the experiences of three countries whose experiences are of interest to us for various reasons. Catalonia is an example of a country where the 'minority' language is used as a medium of internal administration and as the principal medium for the provision of services to the public. It is the linguistic situation in the Basque country that resembles most closely the situation of the Welsh language in Wales as regards the numbers and the density patterns of speakers of Basque, and where the considerable difference between Basque and Spanish syntax and grammar reflect the considerable differences between the Welsh and English. Finally, we shall look at more recent experiences in Ireland in the field of increasing the internal use of Irish.

Legal framework

- 10.5 Catalan is one of the two official languages of Catalonia and the language 'proper to the country'. The 1998 Language Policy Act recognized specific language rights for the country's inhabitants and the right to express themselves in Catalan, both in speech and in writing, in every aspect of their dealings with public bodies. The law designates Catalan as the principal internal administrative language of public bodies and imposes a condition that majority of public servants should be competent in Catalan.
- 10.6 In the Basque Country, Basque is one of the two official languages and the language 'proper to the country'. The Statute of Autonomy of the Basque Country 1979 guarantees the use of Basque and Spanish by public institutions. The Act of Normalisation of the Basque Language 1982 gave a boost to the practical use of Basque within the Government. In addition, the legislation prescribes specific linguistic rights for citizens, including the right to learn and use the official languages of the country.
- 10.7 Irish was designated one of the official languages of the country by the constitution of the Republic of Ireland, and the Official Languages Act 2003 establishes basic rights for the public as regards receiving public services through the medium of Irish and imposes specific duties on public bodies. The Act enables the Government to request public sector bodies to prepare

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

Language Schemes similar to the Welsh Language Schemes administered by public bodies in Wales. The Irish Language Schemes also encompass the internal use that bodies make of the Irish language and all offices of public bodies in the Gaeltacht are required to agree with the Government a timetable for the introduction of internal administration through the medium of Irish.

Policy Guidance and establishing procedures

- 10.8 It has been noted that having robust policy guidance in place is absolutely central for developing a particular language culture in the workplace. In every case, the policy guidance derives directly from national legislation.
- 10.9 Catalan is without exception the default language and work medium of the public sector in Catalonia. This policy derives directly from the Language Normalisation Act of 1983 together with a number of further regulations drawn up since then. As regards communication with the public, again Catalan is the default language. The Act states that Spanish should only be used for communication with a member of the public when it is specifically requested. With over 90 per cent of the population of Catalonia able to understand Catalan, such a policy can be maintained with comparatively little difficulty. Reports and publications are produced bilingually. And, in practice and depending on the nature of the work of the staff, an element of bilingualism can be found in the public workplace. We were also given to understand that some members of staff tend to use Spanish when chatting informally together, although Catalan is the medium of all work e-mails, memoranda, minutes and meetings etc.
- 10.10 In the private sector in Catalonia, internal operation through the medium of Catalan is not a legal requirement. All same, since the 1983 Act imposes a duty on companies to respond to the customer's individual rights to receive service in Catalan, all companies have to consider the implications of this for offering a bilingual service. 'Tacit' / informal general bilingual policies can be found throughout the private sector. In addition, a large number of companies have adopted formal policies for operating either in Catalan or bilingually.
- 10.11 In the Basque Country, the legal framework imposes specific linguistic requirements on the public sector that allow increasing use of Basque as a medium of communication in the workplace. In accordance with the framework, individual units within public administration are designated as units operating bilingually. In practice, this means they use Basque for internal documentation. We were given to understand that the policy operates best in areas where a high proportion of the population are Basque speakers.
- 10.12 As in Wales, Basque Country public bodies operate 'language schemes' which set out policy guidance at a practical and strategic level. In the private sector, companies in public ownership must possess a language scheme. A number of the largest private companies also operate their own language schemes.
- 10.13 According to some 'language schemes', civil servants are expected to work through the medium of Basque. In the areas where the Basque language is

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

strongest, it appears that the minority language may be the only, or principal, language of the workplace for a number of civil servants.

- 10.14 In departments designated as working bilingually the individual has a right to send documents to other departments in Basque. In principle, it is the responsibility of the recipient to arrange translation of a Basque document if it is not understood. In practice, we were given to understand that there is a tendency for the Basque speaker to ask the recipient beforehand and prepare a bilingual version of the document when necessary.
- 10.15 In the bilingual departments, a circulation list is defined for each document (a 'Document Circulation'), which takes into consideration (i) how many people will be reading the document, (ii) whether the document is being distributed for information or whether a decision is required on the basis of its contents, and (iii) how many individuals on the circulation list understand Basque. If only one person is unable to understand Basque, the document will be created in Basque. It is customary to offer a summary or explanation in Spanish as required and according to the nature of the document. Staff tend to ask their colleagues by e-mail 'Can this be sent in Basque?', with a choice of answers: 'Yes/Send a bilingual version'. Staff get to know who within the organisation can understand or deal with documents in Basque.
- 10.16 In private companies, there are examples of documents in Basque being circulated together with instructions to give a spoken explanation of the document to staff who do not understand the language.
- 10.17 In Ireland, it is the Official Languages Act 2005 that establishes the legislative framework, with the Irish Language Schemes which are compulsory for 650 Public Bodies establishing policy guidance in each organisation. So far, 24 bodies have completed their schemes and 17 more are being drawn up. Since these developments are very recent, the process of establishing new procedures to promote the internal use of Irish is in its infancy.
- 10.18 Although Irish Language Schemes encompass organisations' internal use of Irish, so far the focus has been on providing services to the public rather than ensuring that Irish becomes a language of the workplace. However, a number of public and private organisations already work naturally through the medium of Irish, for instance: Foras na Gaeilge, Gaillimh le Gaeilge, and Údarás na Gaeltachta (the Gaeltacht Regional Development Authority) and *An Roinn Gnóthaí Pobail, Tuaithe agus Gaeltachta* (the Department of Community, Rural and Gaeltacht Affairs).
- 10.19 According to a representative of *An Roinn Gnóthaí Pobail, Tuaithe agus Gaeltachta*, the three main challenges facing them from the point of view of developing the language of the public workplace are:
- i. How to make the Irish language part of the natural ethos of the workplace and make the workplace truly bilingual;
 - ii. To develop a procedure to enable staff to carry out internal business through the medium of Irish (especially between one department and another e.g. Finance, Personnel and ITC)
 - iii. To recruit staff (currently, it can be difficult to appoint Irish-speaking staff, particularly in posts at lower levels).

Irish as a job competence

- 10.20 The legislation which designates Catalan as the principal language of internal administration for the country's public bodies also imposes a condition that the majority of public servants should be competent in Catalan. To obtain a post in public administration, candidates are required to pass an examination in Catalan or to show an official certificate proving their skills in the language. Any promotion is conditional on being sufficiently fluent in Catalan to carry out the duties of the post proficiently through the medium of the language.
- 10.21 In the Basque country there are linguistic conditions on some public posts. Article 14, Statute 10/1982 of the Government of the Basque Country, on normalising the use of the Basque language, states as follows: *'the public authorities shall determine the posts for which knowledge of both languages is a requisite'*, and in addition *"that in the public examinations for posts where it is not a requisite the level of knowledge of official languages shall necessarily be taken into account."*²
- 10.22 Organisations are expected to give the highest priority to those posts where there is most contact with members of the public for the designation 'Basque Language Requisite'. In every organisation a percentage of posts are designated 'Basque required' according to the percentage of Basque speakers in the organisation's administrative area. In the case of all other posts, linguistic ability earns extra points, which combine with points for other competences and experience to influence the success of the candidate's application.
- 10.23 The Basque Country model of managing workforce language skills establishes basic steps and conditions in the process of recruiting and contracting staff, which give priority to ensuring that staff have the appropriate language levels for the posts to which they are appointed. Any individual without the required language skills signs a personal plan to undertake the necessary training to gain those skills. It is the responsibility of the Basque Language Normalisation Officer to conduct an annual review of progress in the language skills of the organisation's staff. In order to enable staff to learn Basque to the required standard for carrying out their duties of their posts, they are provided with language training, which is tailored to the needs of the workplace i.e., based on specific competences within the framework of civil service competences.
- 10.24 Requirements for language as a job competence are not found to the same degree in Ireland. Unlike the Welsh Language Schemes in Wales, there is no designation of 'Irish desirable' or 'Irish essential' for public sector posts. All the same, an understanding of Irish is essential for some posts in the Gaeltacht. As in the case of North Wales Police, Irish language skills are also required for entrance into An Garda Síochána (Ireland's National Police Service). The police force is in the process of changing its entrance requirements and Irish language skills are part of the police curriculum.

² Gardner, N. 2006 Public sector Basque language schemes: a brief summary.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

Support for staff

Improving language skills

- 10.25 Compared to the funding for the Welsh for Adults sector, the annual investment of the Basque Country and Catalonia is very substantial. In addition, the field of language teaching and the opportunities to improve staff language skills have been structured very specifically to meet the language skills requirements of the civil service.
- 10.26 Following the setting up of the first Autonomous Government of Catalonia, a great number of language courses were offered to those employed as civil servants in order to develop their language skills to meet the new demands being made on them to operate internally through the medium of Catalan. By this time, as Catalan language skills are compulsory for posts in public administration, language training for staff is unnecessary, since an applicant will not be appointed unless he/she possesses the required language skills. Special courses on administrative language are part of the range of civil service courses.
- 10.27 In the Basque country there is considerable language training provision to meet the requirements for Basque skills for the workplace. Compared with the funding for the Welsh for Adults sector, the annual investment of the Basque Country of almost £20 million is very substantial^{3,4}. In addition, the field of Basque teaching and of Basque Literacy for Adults has been structured specifically in order to meet the civil service requirements for language skills.

“The language requirements system has spawned a substantial, complex, highly organised and well-funded teaching and examining operation open to all regional and local authorities, primarily involving the Basque Government’s civil service institute (HAEE-IVAP, responsible for selecting, training and certifying officials in all areas of competence, including Basque), its adult language teaching body (HABE) and the whole public and private language school system, as well as planners in individual institutions and substantial numbers of civil servants, the justification being that if officials did not enter public service with the requisite skills, opportunities to acquire them should be provided subsequently.”⁵

- 10.28 In recent appointments to posts where the ability to use Basque is required, the linguistic skills of the individual will have fulfilled the requirements of the post. Staff who have been employed for some time, however, have to agree on an individual plan to increase their skills in Basque to the required level for their post. We were given to understand that a weakness in this procedure is that there are so far no adequate systems in place to encourage and support staff to put their new language skills to use (see 5.38 for a support system operated by some work departments). The challenge remains to try to change

³ E.g. Funding for the Basque for Adults Programme for the year 2002-3 was 27 million euros, or about £16-17 million.

⁴ Azkue, J. and Perales, J. 2003 The Teaching of Basque to Adults; HABE www.habe.org/hn-habenet/objetivos/indice-i.htm.

⁵ Gardner, N. 2006 *Public sector Basque language schemes: a brief summary*.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

the language practices of staff who are improving their ability in the Basque language.

- 10.29 As in the Basque Country and Catalonia, Ireland has identified, early on in the process of acting on the requirements of her language legislation, the need to invest in language training specifically tailored to the requirements of the workplace. As in Wales, staff have a tendency to lack confidence to use Irish in the workplace. We were given to understand⁶ that *An Roinn Gnóthaí Pobail, Tuaithe agus Gaeltachta* is in the process of co-operating with the universities and the Institute of Public Administration (IPA) to arrange Irish training provision to meet the requirements of the 650 public bodies which will be implementing Irish Language Schemes. In Ireland, the IPA is the body responsible for developing best practice in the field of public administration and management and developing education and training programmes tailored to meet the requirements of workers in the sector.

Information and communications technology

- 10.30. In today's Information Society an absolutely crucial role is played by information and communications technology. With developments in the field evolving swiftly and ceaselessly, there is no doubt that any language which is to survive within this new system must be part of these developments. In addition, information and communications technology can offer methods to support the management of linguistic variety in the workplace.
- 10.31 The situation in Catalonia offers an example of a country which has recognised the challenge of the information society and has ensured, through legislation, that the Catalan language is central to ITC developments. Article 29 of the 1/1998 Language Policy Act states that the Autonomous Government is required to foster, stimulate and promote:
- *The research, production and commercialization of all kinds of products in Catalan related to the language industries, such as voice recognition, automatic translation and similar systems.*
 - *The production, distribution and commercialization of software in the Catalan language and the translation, if applicable, of these products into Catalan.*
 - *The presence of products and information in Catalan on the telematic information networks.*
- 10.32 As a result of this policy guidance and commitment at government level to investment in the field, use of Catalan will be normalised within the ITC sector. All sorts of products are available in Catalan, for instance spell-checkers, browsers, operating systems and software (e.g. software for palmtops, phones, printers etc). In addition, substantial investment is going into ensuring a constant and up-to-date supplier of cheap and free software in Catalan. The emphasis on ensuring that Catalan is a part of every aspect of ITC developments means that there are no obstacles to operating through the medium of Catalan in the workplace.
- 10.33 In the Basque country too, it is clear that there is very substantial investment in ITC in the Basque language. Here every member of staff in public and

⁶ An interview with Deagla O'Briain, An Roinn Gnóthaí Pobail, Tuaithe agus Gaeltachta.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

private workplaces can take advantage of a number of types of software, including spelling and grammar checkers, dictionaries and glossaries to facilitate the use of Basque in the workplace. The glossary, *Euskalterm* contains synonyms in Basque, French, Spanish, English and Latin.

- 10.34 Unlike the linguistic similarity between Catalan and Spanish, variations in syntax, grammar and vocabulary between Basque and Spanish are as different from those between Welsh and English. As a result, the challenge of creating ITC resources is so much greater and requires additional investment.
- 10.35 There are guidelines for writing Basque documents in clear phraseology similar to the guidelines of *Cymraeg Clir*. In addition, there is guidance on creating bilingual texts, which can cause difficulty as a result of the differences in syntax and grammar. Examples of public documents (such as work contracts), in Basque and in both languages, are given on public websites for use or adaptation. By sharing these sorts of templates, smaller organisations like companies or town councils can avoid having to prepare their own translations.
- 10.36 In Ireland at present there is comparatively little ITC support available for the use of Irish in the workplace. Despite this, there are a number of resources available or being developed, such as the National Terminology Database for Irish which so far lists over 136,000 Irish terms and over 132,000 English terms.

Support from colleagues

- 10.37 In the Basque Country, a system has been developed by a number of public departments and private companies to support the efforts of learners to put their new language skills to work as part of the Basque Language Scheme. In these cases, it falls to the individual work teams to decide how to support an individual's use of Basque after he/she has completed the language training. The support varies according to the needs of the individual and the nature of the team's work. It can include a commitment to write e-mails in Basque, the provision of informal training, and correcting/editing documents. Workplaces vary in their use of formal and informal commitments to use Basque at work.
- 10.38 As in Wales, however, we were given to understand that there is a tendency to consider language training in itself as sufficient to prepare an individual for using Basque at work. We were told that people need encouragement to use Basque in their work, since a high proportion of employees would be able to use the language at work if they received appropriate encouragement and support.

Support from in-house translators

- 10.39 In Catalonia, there are no 'translators' in the sense of having staff who are employed specifically for that purpose. Instead, the linguistic requirements for civil servants mean that every member of staff is sufficiently qualified to be able to use both languages fluently and create Catalan and/or Spanish documents as required.
- 10.40 The emphasis in Catalonia is on developing the technology for automatic translation. With a view to developing multilingualism in society, automatic

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

translation programs have been developed in Catalan, Spanish, English, French and German.

- 10.41 In the Basque country, organisations employing two or more translators are fairly rare. On the whole, it is the Basque Normalisation Officer who is responsible for the body's translation work and proofreading. It is very often the case that Basque texts are proofread by the organisation's normalisation officer or other members of staff who are fluent in the language in order to make the greatest use of written Basque by less proficient staff.
- 10.42 A translation memory system is available to all government staff in the Basque Country. The enormous database of texts assists staff who are less proficient in the language to produce documents in Basque. It is probable, however, that many of those who are fluent in Basque tend not to use this resource. The availability of on-line dictionaries and terminological dictionaries to every member of staff also offers support to staff who venture to write in Basque and reduce the dependency on written translation.
- 10.43 In Ireland, there is no translation support as such, since public bodies do not have their own in-house translation units. At the moment, the tendency is for organisations to hand over texts for translation to private individuals and companies.

Conclusions

- 10.44 The countries mentioned above represent examples of dedicated linguistic planning aimed at changing language practices in the workplace in order to restore to use in the country's public administration a language which historically was excluded from that role. They offer three models very different from the situation existing in Wales today. And yet, when considering how best to increase the use of the Welsh language in the workplace, the examples highlight an number of basic principles:
1. Extensive and standard use of a minority language in the workplace depends on a legal framework which requires public institutions to operate internally in the minority language and which establishes the right of individuals to use the language at work.
 2. Legislation which imposes language conditions for public sector posts creates a system where language competences for posts are standardised across the sector.
 3. This in turn highlights the need to create a range of suitable and standard language competences and administration courses to meet the requirements of working with complete proficiency in the designated language/languages.
 4. The legislation or policy which imposes the language requirements for posts means providing appropriate and practical language training to enable employees to increase their present language skills to meet the new demands of the workplace.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

5. Provision of language courses alone is not sufficient to change the language practices of individuals at work. Steps must also be taken to develop methods of encouraging and supporting staff to use the language they have learnt. In addition, methods need to be developed by each work team to cope with the varied abilities of members of staff.
 6. Recent ITC developments, particularly electronic translation methods - translation memory, automatic translation, speech recognition for vocal translations and translation from text to voice and from voice to text - all offer methods to enable individuals with different language abilities to foster their language skills and to communicate and work together.
 7. With developments in the field evolving swiftly and ceaselessly, the necessary investment must be secured to keep products in the minority language up-to-date and innovative.
 8. This means a commitment at government level to ensure that the minority language is central to the country's ITC development.
 9. In workplaces which operate internally through the minority language a clear role can be seen for translators to offer support through proofreading and correcting texts.
- 10.45. Clearly, on the evidence of the countries mentioned above, internal administration through the medium of Welsh or bilingually and multilingually is perfectly possible, given the legislative support and the investment in the fields of Welsh-language and ITC education and training. There appears to be a need to strengthen the legislation on the Welsh language to include an expectation that public institutions will carry out their internal administration through the medium of Welsh. In the case of language competences, Welsh training and qualifications must be tailored to meet the requirements of public administration. In the field of ITC, there must be extensive investment in new developments in order for the products already available in Welsh to remain up-to-date and innovative, ensuring they are available to everyone in the workplace. Electronic translation methods should also be made a priority.

**11.0 Consideration of relevant elements in three key areas –
recruitment, training and IT**

- 11.1. A background and context to the work of this project is formed by a number of crucial developments in the implementation of statutory language schemes. Specifically, those aspects relating to procuring, developing and facilitating the use of Welsh and English are particularly relevant to the work of the project. We discuss below some of the relevant considerations relating to recruiting, training and developing staff and the use of information technology.

Recruiting, training and developing staff

- 11.2. Many of the developments in the acquisition of bilingual skills can be traced back to the statutory guidelines published by the Welsh Language Board on

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

preparing and implementing Language Schemes.⁷ Among other measures required under guidelines 8(i) and 8(ii), bodies preparing Language Schemes are expected to include in their schemes:

- *"A commitment to ensure that workplaces which have contact with the public in Wales seek access to sufficient and appropriately skilled Welsh speakers to enable those workplaces to deliver a full service through the medium of Welsh.*
 - *A commitment to identify those workplaces and posts where the ability to speak Welsh is essential and those where it is desirable, to identify the level of proficiency required in each case, and to formulate team descriptions and job descriptions accordingly."* (page 38)
- 11.3. The principal methods employed to acquire the necessary skills are by recruiting staff who possess the required skills, or training and developing staff to the necessary levels of ability.
- 11.4. As regards recruitment, the statutory guidelines require that bodies include in their Language Schemes
- *"A commitment that where linguistic ability is considered to be essential or is desirable for any post, this will be specified when recruiting to that post." ...*
 - *"A commitment to ensure that when a non-Welsh speaker is appointed to a post where the ability to speak Welsh is considered essential, a condition of employment will be to learn the language to the required level within a reasonable agreed period, with the full support of the organisation."* (page 41)
- 11.5. As regards Welsh language training for staff, the statutory guidelines require that bodies include in their Language Schemes
- *"A commitment to encourage members of staff to learn Welsh or to improve their ability to speak Welsh, and to support and enable those who wish to do so.*
 - *A commitment to arrange learning and training programmes that focus on workplaces and posts which are important to the implementation of the scheme."* (page 39).
- 11.6. As a result of these requirements, and the way implementation measures have been included in Language Schemes for these purposes, the statutory framework has ensured that all bodies implementing a Scheme have arrangements, approved by the Welsh Language Board, for acquiring, training and developing enough bilingual staff to enable them to operate their Language Schemes effectively.
- 11.7. In practice this means that all such bodies now have Welsh speakers among their staff; the numbers and proportions vary according to the nature of the

⁷ The Welsh Language Board (1996). Welsh Language Schemes – their preparation and approval in accordance with the Welsh Language Act 1993. Cardiff: Welsh Language Board

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

services provided by the body, according to the linguistic profile of the area and/or the nature of the public or users which it serves, and the nature of the commitments in its Language Scheme.

- 11.8. By securing bilingual staff to provide a bilingual service, a potential has also been indirectly created for all bodies operating a Language Scheme to foster and promote the use of Welsh in the workplace beyond just the requirements of contact with the public (which is the main emphasis of Language Schemes).
- 11.9. To facilitate increasing the use of Welsh in workplaces by means linked to recruiting, training and developing staff, the Welsh Language Board has furthered a number of developments and trends and has also sponsored specific projects to this end. More detailed information about the work of the Board in this field can be found on its public website, <http://www.bwrdd-yr-iaith.org.uk/>. Just some of the elements of that work are listed below.
- 11.10. For some years, in discussions with relevant bodies with a view to agreeing and approving the revised versions of their Language Schemes, the Board has been encouraging them to include measures to strengthen internal use of Welsh. One example of this is the encouragement the Board has given organisations to decrease the dependence of their staff on translation services for the production of Welsh Language texts. The Board's argument, which is now being increasingly accepted, is that increasing internal use of Welsh by staff is way of fostering viable bilingual business units that are not dependent on other business units for the ability to communicate bilingually in an effective, efficient and professional manner.
- 11.11. In addition, the Board has continue to provide guidance on good practice through its advice circulars, through its visits to monitor and evaluate implementation, and its written responses to monitoring reports.
- 11.12. In order to assemble and summarise the considerable amount of guidance provided to public bodies on acquiring, developing and managing language skills resources, the Board commissioned Cwmni Iaith to undertake the Bilingual Skills Project on its behalf in 2005-06. The work of the project included research, analysis and reporting on a range of good practices adopted by a number of public bodies in Wales for managing the Bilingual Skills of their workforces. The research element of the work included collecting evidence about good practice in fields such as designating the linguistic requirements of posts; assessing and recording the recruitment, selection and appointment of staff; staff training and development. The Board will be making a version of the final report available to employers in 2007 as a resource to assist them in identifying and adopting good practices. In turn, improving practices in acquiring, developing and managing language skills and resources will be a means of laying a firm foundation for increasing the use of Welsh in workplaces as described in the definition in section 3.0 above.
- 11.13. Another substantial resource being developed by the Board, one which will underpin the work of this project, will be the outcome of Confidence Project 3 - Confidence in speaking, which is being developed in 2007. According to the Board's brief, this project is intended to *'provide a package that will be available primarily for distribution to public bodies and other bodies that work*

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

or would like to work bilingually to support those of their staff who are Welsh-speaking but who lack confidence to do so in formal circumstances in the workplace when discussing work matters. The package can be in the form of a paper, video, sound or computer resource. (...) The resource will assist in raising people's confidence in speaking Welsh when they discuss their work in official circumstances, such as giving an address, receiving or delivering training or sharing information in meetings, workshops, seminars and conferences.' The package is aimed at 'people who can already speak Welsh and who have perhaps been educated through the medium of Welsh, but who are unfamiliar with using the language in the workplace, and who are therefore uncertain what to do. In addition, they may not have much opportunity to use it outside of work'.

- 11.14. As training and developing staff, increasing the confidence of Welsh-speakers and learners, and facilitating the use of Welsh are such crucial components of the way organisations ensure that they have the necessary language skills, the Board has paid a good deal of attention to these aspects.
- 11.15. It has published a handbook, Welsh Language Training in the Workplace: Guidelines (no date / 2001??), to “provide employers - whether from the public, private or voluntary sectors - with practical guidelines and advice on how to recognise, organise and prioritise Welsh language training to meet their needs” (page 2).
- 11.16. It continued to promote *laith Gwaith* materials - staff badges, posters, stickers and other types of materials, to inform users which member of staff speak Welsh and where bilingual services are to be found.
- 11.17. The Board's Guide to Bilingual Design (2001 edition) provides guidance on including Welsh texts in .bilingual documents, publications and signage
- 11.18. To facilitate the use of spoken Welsh at the most basic level, it published the CD *Swnio'n Dda / Sounds Good* (2006) to provide guidance on how to pronounce Welsh names, a short and simple Welsh vocabulary some simple phrases. The CD may be useful, for instance, in fostering the practice use simple Welsh greetings in the workplace, and increasing the practice of using Welsh place-names.

Information and communications technology

- 11.19. A large part of language use in the modern workplace now occurs through the medium of information and communications technology. In its policy document, *laith Pawb*, the National Assembly Government called for information technology strategy to contribute to the aim of creating 'a truly bilingual nation'. The Language Board responded to this call by publishing in 2006 Information Technology and Welsh: A Strategy Document. This document includes (on page 4) a number of targets and statements of policy for integrating and normalising the use of Welsh in the world of IT.
- 11.20. That publication noted the necessity for detailed technical guidelines for the bilingual use of computers and these are to be found in the document Bilingual Software Guidelines and Standards which the Board published in 2006. This document is aimed at three categories of reader, namely

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

- *'developers producing software applications (including websites) for use within Wales or that will potentially be used by Welsh speakers (...)*
 - *any individual involved in the specification or procurement of software applications that will be accessed from within Wales or by Welsh speakers (...)*
 - *policy makers and compliance officers (...)*' (page 7).
- 11.21. The aforementioned documents present detailed information about a number of significant developments in relation to the use of Welsh in the field of IT. Space does not allow us to go into detail here, but we list below some of the main developments which have been very useful in increasing the use of Welsh in the domains discussed in this report.
- 11.22. The Board created an on-screen trial programme, the 'Language Management Centre', which is available free to computer users. With the help of the programme, Welsh can be chosen as the interface language for Windows XP and Office 2003. It also presents a tutorial in the form a 'PowerPoint' presentation on how to type accents and check spelling in Welsh.
- 11.23. IT methods facilitate the work of translation in another field which is sure to contribute considerably to facilitating bilingual working, and over recent years a number of 'translation memory' programmes have been developed to make repetitive translation work easier. There is a full description of the characteristics of translation memory software in the Board's strategy document. Some aspects of computer translation applications are discussed at the end of section 9.0 above when comparing the situation in Wales with other countries.
- 11.24. Other types of very useful software are the spell-checkers, grammar checkers and lexicographical resources that have been developed. A free Open Office spell-checker is available on the *Meddal* website. Canolfan Bedwyr, University of Wales, Bangor, has co-operated with the Board in the development of a 'Cysgliad', package, which includes CySill, a Welsh language grammar and spell-checker, and the lexicographical resource, 'Cysgeir'.

The outlook in these fields

- 11.25. It can be seen from the above discussion, that, more than a decade after the approval of the first statutory Language Schemes, the aids developed by the Welsh Language Board and its various partners for relevant bodies have evolved into something more and more sophisticated and fit for purpose. The different projects sponsored by the Board have given rise to a range of operational tools, guidance and guidelines for coming to grips with the challenges which face organisations in the fields of recruitment, training and information technology - 3 very crucial fields in the process of creating bilingual workplaces.
- 11.26. As different departments of the Board foster more and more expertise and collect more and more information about these different fields, we believe that this trend will continue, with the Board/the Board's successor and its partners targeting their resources and their projects more accurately in response to

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

shortcomings and weaknesses in the current operational methods of the bodies concerned. As a result, we can expect that any systems-based obstacles to the use of the two languages in the workplace will continue to be gradually reduced and solved.

- 11.27. As well as developing more sophisticated responses as part of the process of implementing the Language Act 1993, influence is now being brought to bear on language planning processes from a different direction, namely the requirements and expectations of *laith Pawb*. The vision of *laith Pawb* is succinctly expressed as an aspiration to create ‘*a truly bilingual Wales, by which we mean a country where people can choose to live their lives through the medium of either or both Welsh or English and where the presence of the two languages is a source of pride and strength to us all*’. (page 1)
- 11.28. Since the workplace is a central setting for the everyday lives of a vast proportion of the Welsh population, the commitment to enable people ‘*choose to live their lives through the medium of either or both Welsh or English*’ cannot be fulfilled without influencing the degree to which they are able to do that in their day-to-day work. According to the rationale of *laith Pawb*, then, we can expect that the Assembly Government will wish to influence employers in the future to ensure a regular and unimpeded sequence of opportunities to use Welsh in every aspect of an individual's involvement with the world of work. That is, in addition to seeking to ensure that employees are able to receive information from the employer in Welsh and able to work in Welsh, consideration will also be given to facilitating opportunities for individuals to socialise informally in Welsh with others in the workplace.
- 11.29. Since Welsh was made a statutory and compulsory core subject in the national curriculum for Welsh schools from 1990-91 onwards (following the Education Reform Act 1988), there has been an increase in the number of pupils who leave school possessing bilingual skills. Of course, many of these young people take a pride in the bilingual communication skills and it would be reasonable to expect an increasing number of them to seek opportunities to use Welsh, or both languages, in their careers afterwards. The section in *laith Pawb* which discusses the field of economic development includes actions to achieve ends such as ‘*Accelerating the number of Welsh speakers in business* and ‘*Expanding the horizons of the Welsh-speaking workforce and encourage the use of Welsh in the workplace*’.
- 11.30 The developments and influences outlined above could be expected to raise the level of expectations on the part of Welsh speakers about opportunities to use their Welsh in the world of work.

12.0 An outline of the legal situation

Setting up a context for the legal considerations

- 12.1. Every organisation has its own internal culture or 'atmosphere', arising from a combination of influences - its functions, its policies, its personalities and its practices. It is these influences which are mainly responsible for the type of experience gained when working for it. Where more than one language is used, they combine to create the organisation's 'language culture' as well.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

This is true throughout the world; in the Welsh context, this is certainly true of the use of Welsh and English in the workplace.

- 12.2. At the two extremes, there are organisations which, behind their customer interface, are administered entirely in English or in Welsh. Only a fairly small number come into the second category, because the vast majority if not all of the personnel need to be Welsh speakers. Examples can be found in Section 9.0 above. In general, the two languages are used to different degrees, with English, for practical and demographic reasons, as the principal language of administration, and Welsh - once staff step back from dealing with the Welsh-speaking customer - as a more occasional language between individual employees.
- 12.3. Sometimes, the language, or bilingualism, of the administration is a matter of central policy by an explicit and fundamental decision. Often, however, it is a rational and practical result of the circumstances which drive the decisions of the workplace. In large organisations, it can vary from one part of the organisation to another according to location or function or personalities. In an 'informal' situation then, it is the proportion and influence [e.g. status, location] of those who wish to use Welsh which decides how much use is in fact made of that language internally.
- 12.4. At any one time then, whether through a decision or by the evolution of circumstances, a linguistic pattern of internal operation exists in an organisation. Before moving on to practical considerations about increasing the use of Welsh in the workplace, we should consider:
- Are there legal implications in the field of employment and human rights to decisions about the use of a language or languages in administration?
 - Specifically, is it legal to take institutional steps to increase the internal use of Welsh?

This is discussed by looking at some situations currently possible in the workplace.

Prohibiting staff from speaking a particular language together at all

- 12.5. An absolute and unconditional rule of this sort on the part of an organisation or the representative of an organisation [e.g. a particular manager] would be contrary to human rights. It could also be racial discrimination if the prohibited language is connected with people of a different ethnic or national origin to the rest of the workforce.
- 12.6. For an organisation to discipline or dismiss staff for using a prohibited language in such circumstances would probably be a breach of the Race Relations Act 1976. In the same way, it would be illegal to create a situation where it became impossible for staff to remain [for instance by harassment or by discrimination in the distribution of work or in performance assessment and promotion] because of their use of the prohibited language. The decision in the Industrial Tribunal case *Williams v Cowell*, for example, illustrates this in relation to an employer prohibiting the use of Welsh.
- 12.7. These days more enlightened attitudes, together with legislative developments and highly-publicised cases, mean that it is unusual to hear of a language's being prohibited.

A rule that only one language is to be used in the organisation's administration although staff speak more than one language

- 12.8 Usually, this is a decision made for practical reasons, such as operational effectiveness (costs and time), ensuring that everyone understands, reducing risk when taking decisions, and fostering a single workplace culture. This is the policy of many organisations, particularly in the private sector where English is used throughout in service and administration. It is an understandable decision, which is led by the business needs of the employer rather than discriminatory or racial motives.
- 12.9. As already mentioned, there are examples of bodies and businesses carrying out their administration through the medium of Welsh, including some with non-Welsh-speaking staff working for them. For these organisations, it is sometimes also a matter of principle - supporting or promoting the Welsh language and its use - alongside the practical reasons usually found. Once again, there is no discriminatory or racial intention.
- 12.10. If the language rule has existed from the beginning or for a very long period, then probably everyone who already works for the organisation is able to cope with the situation - as passive participants if not entirely comfortable. However, if the present organisation decides to adopt the language rule and if that means a change in the established linguistic pattern of the workplace, then as well as causing anxiety, the results can create difficulty for some people, and that in turn can have a discriminatory effect and be against the law.
- 12.12. When adopting a language rule, the organisation in essence assumes that all the staff employed on the date of the decision are sufficiently fluent in the chosen language of administration to be able to carry out the associated administrative tasks effectively. It assumes that they are under no disadvantage that could undermine their performance and their promotion prospects. If that is not the situation, and if some of the current staff are going to have difficulty in coping in the chosen language, then the organisation should accept that it has a responsibility to take that into account in its arrangements, and to assist the affected staff in an appropriate way in order to try to eliminate the disadvantage. If it does not do this, it may be guilty of discrimination. Notice that it is disadvantage and not inconvenience that counts in this connection.
- 12.13. In the context of mainstream bilingualism in Wales, the crucial point in the perception of inequality is the view that the rule would give Welsh speakers an advantage at the expense of their non-Welsh-speaking colleagues, but exactly the same considerations apply when dealing with foreign workers who are unable to cope in English or Welsh.

A policy intentionally aimed at increasing the internal use of the Welsh language

- 12.14. Until recently, with some exceptions, the 'language shift' in Wales was mainly from Welsh to English. Something that contributed considerably to the change, as well as a drop in the number and/or percentage of Welsh speakers, was their high level of bilingualism and their readiness to use English when faced with the monolingual English of their colleagues. Crucially

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

for this tendency, administration through the medium of English was not a practical difficulty for them, while administration through the medium of Welsh raised considerable difficulties for their colleagues.

- 12.15. What then are the legal implications of taking some deliberate institutional steps to try to reverse this trend, and to increase the internal use of Welsh, but without creating an absolute language rule? Clearly, the result is going to depend on the exact nature of the steps and the disadvantage they can cause. But to put it simply, it can be assumed that some steps, such as holding team meetings or providing training in Welsh only, without translation facilities, will create difficulties for non-Welsh-speaking staff and put them at a disadvantage.
- 12.16. If, for example, the organisation were to give notice of its intention and the date of implementation, and introduce a language training programme, then this would be a suitable way of assisting those staff to overcome their disadvantage before the rule came into operation. In the same way, providing a translation service for staff use would also be helpful. Assuming justification for the introduction of the rule, these steps would not only be wise as regards maintaining goodwill, but also likely to protect the organisation from an accusation of discrimination. These few obvious examples show that the practical implications are both real and considerable.
- 12.17. New staff, joining the organisation after the decision has come into effect, are in a different situation. It can be assumed that their ability in the chosen language of administration is one of the skills measured at interview, and they will be aware of the requirements when they join the workforce. The likelihood is that their linguistic abilities will be sufficient to cope or they would not have been appointed, and that they will have no objection to the situation. However, their advent will be likely to add to the anxieties of those who do not speak Welsh.
- 12.18. To put it simply then, an organisation has a perfect right to increase its internal use of the Welsh language, on condition that it also accepts its responsibility to its staff to take appropriate practical steps to seek to rectify any disadvantageous side-effects that can cause discrimination in the eye of the law.

**Section 3: Recommendations - Widening the
influence of the project**

13.0 A consideration of the resources that will be required to change practices in different settings

13.1. On the basis of the evidence collected and of our experiences throughout this project, we suggest that bodies that are considering increasing the use of Welsh in their internal administration should consider the following steps and measures when planning to change language use patterns. The steps listed indicate a process that an organisation could adapt according to its own culture and practices:

Policy and procedures:

- Creating a policy on language use within the administration, referring to the definition of bilingual workplaces offered in this report.
- Wide-ranging consultation on this policy among managers, staff and unions.
- Including in the planning individuals or services that are to provide support.
- Mapping current language practices as a baseline and monitoring progress from that.
- Securing appropriate promotional materials, either within the organisation itself or from external organisations.
- Ensuring corporate ownership of the development, including ownership by political representatives where relevant.
- Ensuring that a lead is given by the higher echelons of management, one that attaches prestige to the Welsh language and to working bilingually.
- Designating internal responsibilities for different specific aspects of introducing the changes.
- Considering drawing up protocols for aspects such as:
 - Internal meetings
 - Sending e-mails
 - Placing material on the intranet
 - Making telephone calls
- In larger organisations, considering whether it would be appropriate to introduce a rolling programme, by individual service unit, over a period of time.
- Marketing and promoting the change in practice, both internally and externally.
- Linking the plan for increasing the use of Welsh internally with a Bilingual Skills Strategy, including robust policies on recruiting and developing bilingual skills.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

- Creating, implementing and regularly updating an appropriate ITC strategy. The aim of such a strategy would be to plan for acquiring, developing and ensuring effective use of ITC programmes and other merchandise that will facilitate the use of Welsh internally.

Support for staff

- Drawing up an Action Plan that ensures staff receive appropriate support in changing their practices.
- Introducing a language awareness training programme as a means for laying a foundation of common knowledge and understanding for managers and staff, and to facilitate a change in language use patterns within the organisation.
- Installing appropriate Welsh language ITC software and providing training in its use, giving priority to language correction software and an on-screen lexicographical resource.
- Facilitating access to useful online resources, e.g. TermCymru.
- Developing the use of bilingual templates for forms and documents for internal and external use and facilitating increasing use of translation memory software.
- Offering various courses for language learning and improvement.
- Setting up a mentoring scheme for learners, including general information for all staff on appropriate ways of giving support, as well as guidelines and aids for learners and mentors.
- Considering pairing individuals who have little confidence in their Welsh with confident individuals in the workplace to facilitate progress.
- Using the organisation's intranet to establish a focus for the scheme to change practices and for central resources.
- Ensuring an adequate supply of appropriate language aids in the form of a dedicated space (e.g. a 'Welsh practice room'), dictionaries, glossaries, grammars, software for learning and practice, visual aids etc.

Maintaining change

- Regularly publicizing staff successes as they develop their use of Welsh.
- Ensuring that discussions about developing language skills are mainstreamed in staff support and appraisal interviews, and evaluations of manager performance.
- Creating in-house settings where staff can socialize in Welsh, e.g. a learners' room, *Siop Siarad* / lunchtime chat sessions etc.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

- Creating opportunities for staff to socialize outside working hours.
- Setting up a working party of suitable 'champions' to review progress and co-ordinate efforts.
- Creating a supportive relationship with bodies whose administration is already through the medium of Welsh or bilingual, in order to learn practical lessons and / or enter into a mentoring relationship.

14.0. Wider recommendations for the Welsh Language Board on how to develop the use of Welsh in the workplace

General findings

14.1. As a background and context to our recommendations to the Welsh Language Board on how to develop the use of Welsh within workplaces, we offer the following findings and considerations:

- The strength of the tradition of public administration through the medium of English, and its influence on the attitudes and confidence of Welsh speakers.
- The positive response of staff to the opportunity they were offered, their keenness to increase the use of Welsh in their work and the positive way they took advantage of opportunities to receive training and support resources.
- The importance of creating an atmosphere of encouragement deriving from robust policy guidance, an atmosphere of celebrating progress, the support and encouragement of managers and the availability of supportive measures.
- The fact that changing language practices is a sensitive process which takes time and should not be rushed through faster than the staff and the support arrangements can cope with in relation to their day-to-day work and priorities, their personal perceptions and their initial confidence.
- A positive lead is needed at a number of levels, including a working party at the executive level to co-ordinate supportive initiatives, as well as interest and encouragement at the strategic management level in order to achieve the aim.
- Having someone specified as a motivator, whether in-house or externally, is also a help to ensure progress.
- The central role of language correction software and internal e-mail practices in increasing the confidence of individuals to seek to create Welsh texts.

Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –

- The potential to create a bilingual internal culture through services offered to staff in relation to Human Resources; pensions information; internal publicity; internal circulars, both electronic and paper; internal staff bulletins; the bilingualism of the intranet etc.
- The positive impact of the project on the use of Welsh in the personal and family lives of the participants.
- The way a project of this type can contribute to empowering participants by increasing their confidence and their pride in their language skills and in Welsh language culture, and their sense of identity.
- The definite advantage of establishing a specific plan and project to ensure progress.

Recommendations for the attention of the Welsh Language Board

1. Encourage institutions to develop policy statements about language use in the workplace.
2. Consider including measures to develop bilingual workplaces when Language Schemes are reviewed.
3. Work with the Assembly to include plans for developing bilingual workplaces in mainstreaming strategies, as part of a wider programme for implementation by public sector bodies in response to *laith Pawb*.
4. Continue to encourage organisations to adopt Language Skills Strategies, and link that with increasing the internal use of the Welsh language.
5. Hold an annual symposium of bodies whose administration is either bilingual or in Welsh, or that are considering expanding their internal use of Welsh.
6. Publish a convenient guide based on Section 13 above, to assist bodies considering expanding their internal use of Welsh.
7. Co-operate with the Association of Welsh Translators and Interpreters to develop the supportive role of translation units in this connection.
8. Co-operate with the new Welsh Language Teaching Centres to develop and promote a number of opportunities, both traditional and new, for language learning and improvement in the workplace, with particular attention to developing learning routes based on gaining and developing competences for communicating in workplaces.
9. Continue to promote the development of Welsh-language IT for the workplace, in co-operation with Canolfan Bedwyr, Rhwydiaith and others in order to expand availability and use.
10. Encourage bodies to provide Welsh-medium or vocational training under their present Language Schemes.

***Report on the Project for Promoting Bilingual Workplaces
– Final version –***

11. Establish a 'Iaith Gwaith' ('Working Welsh') section on the Board's website as a central point of reference for advice on increasing the internal use of Welsh.
12. Develop the concept of the 'internal customer', encouraging public bodies to develop bilingual internal services to their staff, e.g. human-resources services, pensions information, internal publicity, the intranet, internal circulars etc.

*

*

*